

PASSION, CONTROVERSY AND VISION: A HISTORY OF THE LIBRARY OF AMATEUR JOURNALISM

In Memoriam: Edwin Hadley and Nita Gerner Smith

Kenneth W. Faig, Jr.
Historian, The Fossils, Inc.

I don't know that a very strong argument can be made, to the outside world, for the literary value of what we do, but I don't think that's the point. To me, if a guy named Hadley Smith thought it was important enough to sacrifice so much of his life for it, then I guess we ought to consider it important enough to follow through as best we can. If for no other reason than that his life's work may not have been in vain—Roy Lindberg.¹

Amateur journals are by their very nature fragile entities. Most often, they perish when the amateur journalist himself loses interest in the hobby. Even when an alumnus of the hobby preserves his papers after his own activity ceases, they often fall victim to house-cleanings when changes of residence occur. Even the legacy of an alumnus careful enough to preserve the relics of his hobby activity throughout his entire lifetime is likely to perish when his estate is settled. The paper which Thomas (Tad) Lincoln published with Sterling K. Rounds was a fortunate exception; both Rounds and Lincoln's elder brother Robert T. Lincoln preserved copies.

One of these copies later came into the hands of the man whose work was the beginning of the Library of Amateur Journalism. Born in Philadelphia on October 16, 1869, Edwin Hadley Smith entered the National in 1889. His first paper was *Critique*, but he was better known for *The Rising Age*, published with Walter C. Chiles beginning in 1891, and *The Boys' Herald*, a famous title which he took over in 1904 and continued to publish through 1916, with a revival in the thirties. In 1917 Smith married Nita Gerner (1881-1969), the daughter of amateur journalist Richard Gerner (1856-1885), one of the 1876 founders of the National. He made his principal mark in amateur journalism as a politician in the National; for many years he and Charles Robert Burger (1865-1939) were famous (or infamous, depending upon your point of view) for their behind-the-scenes influence on National politics. The National elected Smith its president at the 1933 convention in New York City, but he resigned the office immediately and was succeeded by Harold Segal. Until 1903, when he resigned to devote full time to his collection of amateur journals, Smith worked for insurance companies. In 1914, he was employed by the Department of Commerce in Washington DC, where he spent the remainder of his business career. Smith died on March 22, 1944, after an illness of several weeks, and his obituary appeared in *The Fossil* for August 1944.

¹ *The Fossil*, April 1977, p. 10.

The Library of Amateur Journalism owes its existence to the collecting passion of Edwin Hadley Smith, which he pursued throughout his lifetime. The formation and development of Smith's collection through 1908, when it was deposited in the Pratt Institute Free Library in Brooklyn, was chronicled at great length in a copiously illustrated article "Smith's Collection: Its Inception, Development and Culmination" by Charles W. Heins in *The Boys' Herald* for September 1908.² Smith did not begin his collecting passion with amateur journals: as an employee of the Girard Fire Insurance Company in Philadelphia, he developed the habit of collecting old insurance policies. A prominent agent who examined Smith's collection of 400 old policies determined it to be of such historical value that it was accepted for permanent preservation by the Pennsylvania Historical Society. By 1896, Smith was living in Salt Lake City and in need of a new outlet for his collecting passion. Then David W. Jagger of Newburgh, New York, an old-timer active in the 1870s, published a notice in William R. Moscow's *The East* for March 1896 offering his indexed collection of 2,000 amateur journals from that period to any amateur journalist who would reimburse him for the \$10 cataloging cost of the collection. Smith did not have the immediate financial resources to purchase Jagger's collection but he obtained an option on its purchase. He was finally able to complete the transaction in 1898 and in one blow he had his first papers antedating 1880. Fascinated by its contents, Smith spent at least one full vacation cataloging the Jagger collection. A true collector's instinct motivated him to try to fill its gaps, and by 1899 he was in correspondence with old-timers across the country in the earnest attempt to acquire more old papers. Charles H. Fowle of Boston was the first old-timer to donate his collection *en masse* to Smith, and Frank J. Martin, William F. Babcock, Edward A. Oldham and George W. Hancock followed suit. Other old-time amateur journalists like Charles C. Heuman, Edwin B. Swift, Charles R. Burger and Theodore G. Meyer donated large groups of papers. Still others, like Frank E. Williams, John L. Tomlinson, William H. Greenfield, E. E. Ericson, Wallace B. Grubb and John H. Campbell sold collections to Smith at modest prices. Eventually, Smith's scope expanded from North America to Europe, and he acquired the collection of English amateur journalist Edward F. Herdman for six pounds (then about thirty U.S. dollars), the largest price he had paid for any acquisition through the writing of Heins's

² Heins's history of L.A.J. was reprinted, without the original illustrations, in four installments in *The Fossil* between July 1981 and April 1982. There is also an excellent survey of the history of the collection in Truman J. Spencer's *The History of Amateur Journalism* (The Fossils) under the title "The Fossil Library" at pp. 103-106. Harold Segal's *The First Hundred Years...* (Philadelphia PA: privately published, 1976) contains (pp. 25-29) an updated history of the collection which can also be found online at www.amateurpress.org/ajhist/ajlib.htm on the National Amateur Press Association website.

chronicle in 1908. Percy Leng Day of Wakefield, England—perhaps Smith’s closest rival as a collector of amateur journals—helped Smith expand his scope to continental Europe as well.

When Smith removed from Salt Lake City to New York City in 1899, he had to pay \$11.00 freight for his 290-pound packing case of amateur journals. Since Smith had as yet no fixed address in New York, old-time amateur J. Austin Fynes, general manager of Proctor’s Theatres, accepted delivery for the collector. Between 1899 and 1902, Smith stored the collection at Linde’s warehouse on Hudson Street, near his own apartment. Then in June 1902, he rented an unfurnished three-room apartment in a tenement at Furman and Joralemon Streets in Brooklyn, near the New York ferry, and removed the entirety of the collection to that location. A photograph of one room’s massive, unorganized accumulation of material adorns Heins’s account.³ Slowly but steadily, Smith began the work of sorting and cataloging the collection. Having saved some money, Smith in February 1903 resigned the clerkship with the Fidelity and Casualty Insurance Company which he had held since October 1899, in order to devote full-time to organizing, cataloging and developing his collection. He determined to organize his amateur journals by year of publication and by publication title within year. A card catalog was commenced to provide ready reference to the collection.

By the time Heins wrote in 1908, Smith’s collection had increased to 25,700 papers, 1600 of which were published outside North America. The collection also included 590 amateur books, 3300 printed “relics,” 1150 newspaper cuttings and 1350 photographs (850 of individuals and 500 of groups). Smith was assiduous in identifying the persons depicted in amateur groups and *The Boys’ Herald* contains numerous articles and correspondence relating to such identifications. Smith’s collection easily surpassed its nearest rivals, those of two Ohio amateurs, Harry Marlow of Warren and Warren J. Brodie of Cleveland. Smith’s determination to preserve his collection for more than just personal use was a distinguishing mark of his collecting passion. Early on, the idea of a privately-funded foundation to preserve the collection was in Smith’s thoughts. Heins wrote of Smith’s plans

to build a concrete or fire-proof bungalow, a combination of bachelor apartment, library and ideal amateur den, bringing together under one roof his collection of papers, clippings, books, photographs and relics, for displaying to the resident and traveling

³ This photograph was reproduced by Charles W. Heins in his article on Smith’s collection in *The Boys’ Herald* for September 1908. Therein Heins gives credit for the photograph to *The National Amateur* (vol. 30 no. 5) for May 1908. (The writer has not seen the original publication in *The National Amateur*.) The photograph was reprinted by Stan Oliner in *Library News* (number 12) for July 1976. Oliner states that the photograph was taken by Smith in his apartment at 219 West 18th Street, New York City, in August 1907. The August 1907 date is difficult for the writer to believe if indeed the collection was fully cataloged and bound and ready for deposit on the shelves of the Pratt Institute in November 1908. However, it is possible that the photograph does date to 1907 and represents uncataloged portions of Smith’s collection. In later years, Smith did dispose of many duplicates to collectors like Hyman Bradofsky.

amateurs of the present and the past, passing into a semi-public institution, upon his death, under the guardianship of an incorporated trust company, for preservation to posterity. Such an air-castle in contemplation is infinitely preferable to having the collections split up and lost in the mazes of a general public library.

An early Smith will, naming attorney and amateur journalist Louis C. Wills as executor, deeded the collection to the Library of Congress or another library willing to accept it in the event of his death. Over the years, a few notable collections of amateur journals have passed to institutional libraries. In 1918, Warren J. Brodie donated his collection of approximately 15,000 papers to the Western Reserve Historical Society in Cleveland, where it is still preserved today. In 1939, Charles W. “Tryout” Smith donated his collection of approximately 18,000 papers to the New York Public Library, where it is also still preserved today. Upon the death of Truman J. Spencer in 1944, his magnificent collection passed to the already-extant collection of amateur journals at the American Antiquarian Society in Worcester, Massachusetts, a collection fostered by longtime curator Clarence S. Brigham and amateur journalists Frank R. Batchelder and Edward H. Cole.⁴ Many other notable collections of amateur journals, however, appear to have been dispersed or destroyed upon the deaths of their owners. Other notable collections, including those of Linden Dey of Chicago and of Leon Stone of Australia, perished in fires.

By 1907-08 Smith reached the decision to bind the amateur journal portion of his collection, following his basic organization by year of publication and by publication title within year. There were to be two basic series of bound volumes: one for American journals and one for foreign journals. The only title to be bound separately was *The National Amateur*. Smith eschewed classifying papers by size for binding, but bound all his papers in volumes of uniform size, cutting the largest papers to fit and using guards to mount small papers in order to prevent warping of the assembled volumes. The thickness of each volume is about two inches, varying only as necessary to prevent splitting of initial letters within publication year. In the end, Smith obtained a quotation from the Reliance Trading Company (a subsidiary of the Salvation Army) to perform the entire binding and stamping work for a flat fee of \$250—about \$1 per volume. Heins’s article contains a number of photographs of the binding work in progress.

By mid-1908, the binding and stamping work was nearing completion. The two contenders for providing a first home for the assembled collection were the Pratt Institute Free Library in Brooklyn (Isabel Ely Lord, Librarian) and the New York Public Library (Astor Collection). The New York Public would accept the collection only as a permanent gift, while the Pratt Institute offered to care for the collection as a deposit, with ownership still retained by Smith. That clinched the matter. As recorded by John W. Smith in his article “The Edwin Hadley Smith Collection” in *The Boys’ Herald* for December 1908, the collection went to the Pratt

⁴ Today the amateur journalism collection of the American Antiquarian Society is estimated to contain approximately 55,000 amateur journals.

Institute Library, where it was formally opened to the public on November 5, 1908. An exhibition of some of Smith's amateur "relics" accompanied the opening. Both the Gotham and the Brooklyn Amateur Press Clubs met in a room at the library on November 3 and passed resolutions in Smith's honor. Ms. Lord was elected an honorary member of the Gotham Club in gratitude for her services. A photograph accompanying Heins's article depicts the 267 bound volumes of 27,500 amateur papers and their 10,500-card catalog in 16 drawers as installed on 43 feet of shelves at the Pratt Institute. The opening received considerable attention in the press. Amateur journalists (including those who attended the July 1909 National convention in New York) were not the only early visitors. Seventy-two-year old Mrs. A. M. Miller visited the collection on November 2, 1908. Mrs. Miller came to see *The American Youth*, published by four boys who crossed the ocean to attend the Vienna International Exposition in 1873. Her late son, William Furber Miller, had been one of those boys. J. S. Billings, director of the New York Public Library, was not a sore loser, but wrote to Smith to congratulate him on the placement of the collection at the Pratt Institute Library. Another congratulatory letter came from old-timer David W. Jagger, whose collection of 2,000 amateur journals had first ignited Smith's collecting interest.

From the first, it was Smith's intention to keep the collection up to date with the current products of the amateur journalism hobby. The inevitable year-to-year growth in collection size has in retrospect been one of the most difficult aspects of institutional deposit. By 1913, the Pratt Institute Free Library, which had welcomed the collection only five years before, was insisting that it be removed. Fortunately for Smith, Dr. Talcott Williams, director of Columbia University's Pulitzer School of Journalism stepped forward to offer a new home for the collection. Smith consented to the removal of the collection to Columbia, which was accomplished on December 1, 1913. The terms of the deposit were even more stringent than those agreed upon with the Pratt Institute Free Library; in addition to retaining title to the collection, Smith also controlled access. The collection at Columbia could only be consulted with his permission. Smith continued to update the collection through publication year 1915, but eventually the authorities at Columbia University, like those at the Pratt Institute Free Library before them, became concerned about large additions of contemporary material to the collection.

Smith appealed to the active amateur journalism associations to establish a foundation to provide a home for the collection, but two appeals, the second launched by George Julian Houtain without Smith's consent, were unsuccessful. Finally, Smith appealed to The Fossils, and negotiations concerning the collection were opened. On March 15, 1916, Charles C. Heuman (1857-1940) purchased the entire collection, updated through December 31, 1915, from Smith for the sum of \$250, the same sum which Smith had originally expended to bind the collection. At the time of sale, the collection consisted of 29,384 amateur journals, 1775 professional clippings, 728 amateur books, 2178 photographs and 4468 printed "relics." Mr. Heuman received a proper deed of sale from Smith, and thereby became sole owner of the famous collection.

Heuman's intention was to deed the collection to The Fossils as soon as proper arrangements could be made for its care. The collection remained on display at Columbia

University while a Fossil committee consisting of Heuman (chair), Joseph Dana Miller, J. Austin Fynes and Louis Kempner considered its disposition. From the start, the viewpoint of The Fossil leaders was different from that of Smith himself. The Fossils, whose membership was then restricted to amateurs active prior to 1890, wanted to preserve the papers from their period of activity, which they perceived as a “golden era” of boy and girl editors. Fossils like Heuman saw the later predominance of mature adults in the hobby as a weakening of the foundations of the hobby. In the same issue (April 1916) of *The Fossil* which announced his purchase of the Smith collection, Heuman wrote:

Edwin Hadley Smith has taken no account of this profound change in amateur journalism in amassing his collection. A collection can have no educational value unless it teaches something. It must illustrate progressive development, and it must stop when progressive degeneration sets in, unless its purpose is pathological. Files of most of the papers published during the golden period of amateur journalism are an inspiration to youth, if youth can be attracted thereto, and if such a collection could be displayed within a reasonable compass.

But here is a collection swollen with the product of the past fifteen years, without regard to quality, and to which was to be added the worthless output of the present, and the presumably worthless output of the illimitable future; and which embraces every conceivable trifle connected in the remotest degree with amateur journalism, such as visiting cards, menus, invitations, etc.—a collection, in short, absolutely without proportion, and without a definite purpose; an enormous conglomeration in which a hundred gems are buried under tons of rubbish.

If Mr. Smith can bear to have his collection emasculated; if he will permit a competent commission to sift out the grain and discard the chaff, I am confident that a suitable shrine for its display and perpetuation can and will be provided. In that way, and only in that way, can his patience, perseverance, energy, self-denial and loyalty be fittingly recognized, and he will then know that his labors have not been in vain.

Stern words from the new owner of Smith’s collection. It is not surprising that controversy concerning the trust assumed by The Fossils was not long in arising. George M. Huss, the new President of The Fossils, wrote in his address dated August 1, 1916 (*The Fossil*, August 1916):

The purchase of the remarkable Smith collection by Charles C. Heuman, its subsequent acquisition by the Fossils, and its establishment in a new and permanent home, is a pleasant solution of this vexing and in some ways unfortunate question. Though Edwin Hadley Smith may feel aggrieved at an apparent lack of co-operation in his personal plans in connection with his collection, he should realize that he has accomplished the most stupendous work ever undertaken by an amateur, and that it will remain a monument to his genius and labor.

The committee chaired by Heuman presented its report in the same issue of *The Fossil*. The report was dated July 20, 1916; by that time 53 individual Fossils had subscribed \$485 toward the purchase and maintenance of the collection, more than enough to reimburse chairman Heuman for the purchase price. The committee approached a number of libraries and the New York Press Club, but received no encouragement in their efforts to find a new home for the collection. Therefore they determined to sign a year's lease for room 1302 in the *New York Sun* Building, 150 Nassau Street (corner, Nassau & Spruce Streets) in lower Manhattan, to house the collection and incidentally to provide office space for the then official editor J. Austin Fynes. The initial lease was from August 1, 1916; and while for the first annual term it was less, the rent during most of the nearly twenty years that the collection occupied this space was \$300.00 per year. President Huss appointed Joseph Dana Miller (1861-1939) the first Fossil Librarian. The collection was formally opened to the membership on Tuesday, October 10, 1916, followed by a banquet at Pontin's restaurant in Manhattan. James M. Beck, one of the boys of seventy-six, served as toastmaster at the banquet. In an earlier address to a western Fossil gathering (printed in *The Fossil* for December 1916), Louis Kempner reflected on the acquisition of the collection:

A material change has occurred in our affairs as a result of the purchase by Charles C. Heuman of the Edwin Hadley Smith Collection of Amateur Journalism. Mr. Heuman has permitted the Collection to become the property of our organization. Within the past few weeks Mr. Heuman was reimbursed for the purchase price of \$250. You may recall that Mr. Smith made it known among the Amateur Journalists of the Past, as well as those of the present time, that he was ready to have the Collection taken care of by them. He asked for a house and a lot for the use of the Collection. This would have required ten thousand dollars, but it was not forthcoming. Then Smith reduced the price, and Heuman immediately paid it, as there was a probability that otherwise the Collection would fall into undesirable hands.

Do not misunderstand me. I am not underestimating the work done by Smith. He devoted the best years of his life to this work, and I am sure that the purchase price would not cover one quarter of the sum Smith spent for postage alone, to say nothing of the cost of binding, indexing, etc.

The Collection is now the property of The Fossils. We must care for it in a fitting manner, and every member of the organization must feel that he has a proprietary interest in it. It is now freely accessible at all times, and the rooms are to be your headquarters when you visit New York.

Those of you who have known of the Collection, either through press notices or by seeing it in the Pratt Institute Library, Brooklyn, or in the Library of the School of Journalism in Columbia University, in New York, must agree that it is wonderful. It required twenty years of labor and the expenditure of a considerable sum of money to accumulate the thousands of papers, books, photographs, etc., and to properly classify and arrange them.

When the Collection was on exhibition at the Pratt Institute, it was necessary to obtain Mr. Smith's written consent to see it. Later, when Mr. Smith arranged for its exhibit as a part of the Library of the School of Journalism at Columbia University, it was like the proverbial seeking for a needle in a haystack to find it. Columbia University consists of about one-half a mile of immense buildings, and it was rare indeed to find a person on the grounds who had ever heard of the Collection. Furthermore, it was about to be relegated to the attic, and that would have spelled its ruin.

But in our plans all red tape is dispensed with. The *New York Sun* Building, where the Collection is now on exhibition, is open all hours, night as well as day, and all you must do is to find the building, and that is easy. When you cross the threshold of Room 1302, we want you to feel at home. We want you to feel that you are a part owner of all that is in that room, whether you subscribed for one share or for fifty shares, or whether you contribute one dollar a year for its maintenance or whether you contribute fifty dollars a year. All we ask is that you contribute something, give what you feel you can afford; but give it every year.

The Fossil for December 1916 even included a laudatory account of the collection by George Jerome Miller, then manager of the *Sun* Building. But President Huss and Treasurer Kempner were not finished with their promotional efforts on behalf of the collection. In the spring of 1917 they mailed to each individual Fossil member across the nation a personal key for Room 1302. Nearly three pages of verbal "bouquets" received from Fossils upon receipt of the personal keys were published in *The Fossil* for April 1917, which also provided a list of members who had visited the collection in its new home through April 10, 1917. The annual Fossil banquet and business meeting was customarily held in New York City every April, and beginning in 1917 it became the custom for the Fossils to gather at Room 1302, 150 Nassau Street, before adjourning to their banquet. The annual report of Treasurer Louis Kempner printed in *The Fossil* for September 1917 contained these remarks concerning the collection:

The George M. Huss administration had hardly started when it became known that the Fossils could obtain possession of the famous E. H. Smith Collection of Amateur Journalism. Brother Heuman bought the Collection from Mr. Smith for \$250. The former was willing to turn the Collection over to our organization for the purchase price, and it was agreed that this should be done. Then the question of a proper place for displaying the Collection was brought up, and it was finally decided to rent suitable rooms in the *New York Sun* Building for this purpose. The rental amounts to \$25 per month. The cost for furniture, picture frames, shelving, etc., amounted to close to \$150. I am dwelling upon details here mainly because there is some talk going the rounds that the organization should dispense with the Collection, or rather have it placed where it will entail no expense to the organization.

Personally, I believe the rooms in 150 Nassau Street should be retained until it is definitely settled that we are unable to collect \$300 per annum over and above the other expenses that must be met in order to continue the policy of printing and distributing

three numbers of *The Fossil* during each Fossil year, for this item of \$300 per annum is the only expense necessary to continue the Library in the future. I believe we can collect this extra \$300 each year, consequently I hope the rooms and the Library will be continued.

The financial burden of maintaining the collection at 150 Nassau Street continued to be a subject of discussion among The Fossils. In his presidential message printed in *The Fossil* for December 1919, Charles H. Fowle called upon members to be generous in their donations to support the library and *The Fossil*. A new landlord increased the rent for room 1302 from \$25 per month to \$27.50 per month in 1919, but agreement was reached with the printer of *The Fossil* and *The Single Tax Review* (edited by Joseph Dana Miller, who used room 1302 for office space), to share the rental costs. Rent for room 1302 by fiscal years ending in April was reported as follows: 1919-20, \$317.50; 1919-20, \$350.50; 1920-21, \$360.00. A rent reduction to the original \$25 per month was apparently effected in October 1921. Rental for 1921-22 was \$325 while rental for 1922-23 returned to the original \$300 and remained at this figure for many years. Just how the cost-sharing with the printer of *The Fossil* and *The Single Tax Review* was effected is never made completely clear.

Writing in the same December 1919 issue of *The Fossil* which contained Fowle's presidential message, Vice President Charles R. Sherlock expressed the view that the New York Public Library, a contender for the collection once before in 1908, would accept the collection if The Fossils offered a strong argument in its behalf. Nothing seems to have come of Sherlock's suggestion. From a developmental point of view, the collection lay largely dormant during the period 1916-1935, although the "key club" headquarters provided a gathering place for Fossils before their annual meetings. The Fossils did not discard Smith's accumulations through December 31, 1915, but accepted only occasional donations of material dating from the "golden era" of amateur journalism. *The Fossil* reported donations of material from this era by the widow of William K. Graff (December 1919), by Charles E. Wilson (April 1921), and by George M. Huss (January 1927). The presidential message of Joseph Dana Miller printed in *The Fossil* for November 1921 reflected some of the pressures affecting the organization. With the cost of the rental for room 1302, the annual budget exceeded \$1,000 and the treasury was in a low state. On a hopeful note, President Miller reported the recruitment of Thomas A. Edison as a member of The Fossils. Speaking to issues relating to the library, Miller wrote:

It is perhaps desirable to touch here upon the final disposition of the Fossil Collection. The Jersey City Library, of which my brother, Edmund W. Miller, is Librarian, will take it and as soon as practicable provide a room for it. The library, one of the foremost in this part of the country, is conveniently situated for out-of-town visitors who wish to consult the Fossil Collection. But while such final disposition is agreeable to the Finance Committee, I do not feel that we have the right to come to a decision in the matter until the proposition has been fully discussed by all our members who have vested rights in it. It might very properly be a subject for discussion at the next reunion. With this reference I beg to leave the matter for your consideration.

Nothing seems to have come of Miller's proposal. The exact form in which The Fossils took ownership of the collection remains rather murky. The original Fossil subscribers who reimbursed Heuman for the purchase price never seem to have formed a corporation for the specific purpose of holding the library. However, in 1927, in order to receive a bequest, The Fossils themselves incorporated as a New York corporation. A new census of the library holdings printed in *The Fossil* for November 1922 listed 27,353 American and 2,031 foreign amateur papers dating from October 1812 through December 1915; the census of other, associational items (books, clippings, photographs, relics) appears unchanged from the count at the time of the collection's acquisition in 1916.

The American Antiquarian Society had a long-standing collection of nineteenth-century amateur journals. Amateur Frank R. Batchelder, who was prominent in Massachusetts politics, was a good friend of the Antiquarian Society's curator Clarence S. Brigham, and helped keep interest in the collection alive. As reported in *The Fossil* for December 1924, Mr. Brigham had written to The Fossils on December 22, 1924, to request a back file of *The Fossil*, a request which the brotherhood honored to the best of its ability. Then, as reported in *The Fossil* for January 1927, Mr. Brigham wrote to Charles C. Heuman under the date of November 19, 1926, to offer to buy the collection and to house it appropriately. President Leonard C. Tilden replied to Mr. Brigham on behalf of The Fossils that the library was not for sale. Nevertheless, active discussion of the future of the library continued within The Fossils.

Fossil President Charles W. Richardson once again brought the issue of the long-term future of the library before the membership in his presidential message in *The Fossil* for September 1927:

The Fossil Library should be a question for serious consideration. The time is coming when we shall have to determine what is the best course to pursue with regard to it. Is it not better, while we have a goodly number of members, to discuss what shall be our wishes with regard to this valuable collection? To my mind it is one of the most valuable collections of the thoughtful expressions of youthful activity that exists anywhere, and it should be of great historic value. There is no reason why it should not be retained under our protection and guardianship for as many years as we wish, eventually to be deposited with some great library.

President Richardson met with Herbert Putnam, Congressional Librarian, to discuss the idea of depositing the collection with the Library of Congress. In the resulting exchange of correspondence, published in *The Fossil* for September 1927, Librarian Putnam put the library on record as follows:

I have this morning your note of yesterday, confirming the inquiry which you made in our conversation, to wit: If your society should decide to place in the Library of Congress the accumulated collection representing the library of the Fossils and comprising, as you state, about forty-five thousand papers bound in about one hundred volumes, together with the Richard Gerner collection of about one hundred books and a complete file of

foreign amateur journals; also a number of photographs of former amateurs—whether such an action would be acceptable to the authorities of the Library.

I hasten to assure you that it would, and that the collection, constituting an integral unit of unique interest, would be very welcome here and administered with appreciation of its significance.

In his presidential message dated June 11, 1928 (*The Fossil*, September 1928), James M. Beck seconded ex-President Richardson's suggestion that the library be deposited in the Library of Congress:

We must not lose sight of our plan to put our unrivaled collection of amateur newspapers in the Congressional Library. I can well appreciate the unwillingness of our New York members—among the most loyal of our body—to part with it at present, but I concur in the view of my predecessor that the best ultimate resting place is the great Library of the United States. Men from all parts of the nation are always coming to Washington, and no visit to Washington is complete without a visit to the Congressional Library. I am sure that the Librarian will give this unique collection a fine room, and the fact of its existence will gradually become well known. Future generations of Americans may look with great interest to these footprints of a generation of boys who lived in a very different age than the present and left behind them, when they passed from boyhood into manhood, an evidence of a sincere interest in printing and authorship.

President Beck reported again on the library in his Christmas 1928 message as published in *The Fossil* for January 1929:

The only information that I can at the moment give to the Fossils is that I have received a letter from the Librarian of the Congressional Library, under date of Nov. 13, 1928, in which he reaffirms the letter which he wrote our former President, Dr. Richardson, on July 26, 1927, in which the Librarian said that the gift of our collection to the Library of Congress “would be acceptable to the authorities of the Library,” and he added his assurance that the “collections, constituting an integral unit of unique interest, would be very welcome here and administered with appreciation of their significance.”

This again brings up the question whether we should not at no distant day take advantage of this offer. I appreciate the indisposition of many of our members to remove this collection from New York to Washington, and yet every Fossil could take a legitimate pride if, in the capital of the Nation and in its marvelous Library, this unique record of the American youth of fifty years ago was placed in a separate room and made, as it would be made, an object of special interest to the innumerable visitors from all parts of the country who visit the Congressional Library.

However, this collection is primarily made for our own pleasure and satisfaction, and I would be slow to advise a removal to Washington if it involved any disappointment to our

New York members, who have always been most active in the affairs of the association and whose wishes in the matter should certainly be given great weight. Moreover, our annual dinners are generally held in New York, and on those occasions the visiting faithful find pleasure in going to our Library and seeing it in its own surroundings. The question of policy is not free from doubt, but it should be determined after careful consideration. One thing, however, is clear, and that is that we must not lose this unique opportunity to give our collection an abiding place in the Nation's Library. If we delay too long in accepting the generous offer we may lose the opportunity forever.

Leonard E. Tilden's "The Fossil Library" as printed in *The Fossil* for April 1930 was the next major communication relating to this subject. Tilden objected to the proposal to donate the collection to the Library of Congress on the grounds that a long-ago donation of amateur journals by Foster Gilroy had disappeared in the same institution. Tilden stated his opposition to the proposed donation of the collection to the Library of Congress "unless a special space was provided...and assurances given for its proper care, because of the disappearance of the Gilroy publications." James M. Beck responded to him by letter:

You stated the same thing last year. I talked with Mr. Putnam about it, and Mr. Putnam said there was no record of any one of the name of Foster Gilroy having deposited any publication at the Congressional Library and that no such amateur publications are in the Library.

For once, the learned advocate Mr. Beck was refuted; Tilden tracked down Gilroy, who produced documentary proof, including acknowledgment from Putnam, of his 1901 gift to the Library of Congress. Tilden concluded:

In view of the facts, I opine the membership of The Fossils will require assurances that if the Fossil Library is turned over to the Congressional Library at any future time there be an ironclad agreement drawn by the Hon. James M. Beck that a proper space and proper care will be provided for it, so that in after years no one in the Congressional Library can say, "There is no record of the Fossils having deposited any publication at the Congressional Library and no such amateur publications are in the Library."

Inasmuch as the American Antiquarian Society of Worcester, Mass., of which former President Coolidge has lately been elected President, has written to the Fossils wishing to buy their Library and assuring proper space and care for it if purchased, it would seem that if the Congressional Library is eventually to have it free of cost, they should be willing to specifically state amount of space assigned, location, and that proper care will be given it in perpetuity.

The alleged "disappearance" of Foster Gilroy's 1901 donation of "several thousand" amateur papers to the Library of Congress has been rattling around amateur journalism for nearly three-quarters of a century. The 1932 donation of 229 issues of 112 titles by Ernest R. Burton of Chevy Chase, Maryland to the Library of Congress has also been stated to have "disappeared."

After the establishment of the Library of Amateur Journalism at the Franklin Institute in 1935, Fossil President Frederick Bowersock pressed Congressional Librarian Putnam hard about the Gilroy donation. Edwin Hadley Smith reported on the result of Putnam's search in *Library News* (whole no. 2) for April 1936. Smith reported that Putnam had found 457 issues of 131 titles donated by Gilroy and that the titles donated by Gilroy, Burton and a January 1936 donation of 38 papers by the American Antiquarian Society had been cataloged and were then housed (unbound, in wrappers) in the rare book room on the second floor of the Jefferson Building of the Library of Congress. Fossil President Frederick Bowersock reported on the same developments at the Library of Congress in his presidential message dated March 26, 1936 in *The Fossil* for April 1936. President Bowersock reported that "there is reason to believe that the remaining papers of the [Gilroy] collection will now very shortly be brought to light" and invited Fossils who wished to make donations of amateur journals to the Library of Congress to do so through him. The writer is unaware whether any further portions of the Gilroy collection were recovered or whether any further donations of amateur journals were made through President Bowersock. One might imagine that Herbert Putnam never wished to hear again of amateur journals after *l'affaire Gilroy*, but in the same issue of *The Fossil* President Bowersock printed a letter from Putnam requesting the donation of a file of *The Fossil*.

Past donations of amateur journals to the Library of Congress again came to the fore in 1957 when Ernest R. Burton and Victor A. Moitoret, while attending that year's N.A.P.A. convention in Washington DC, consulted the Library about Burton's 1932 donations. They were then reported to be "missing." A June 12, 1976 letter from Leonard Beck of the Special Collections Department of the Library of Congress published by Stan Oliner in *Library News* (number 12) for July 1976 helps to clarify the facts:

Let me assure you as to the physical well-being of the "amateur publications." They are housed with the other special collections and receive the same advantages of environmental conditioning and security. I must acknowledge that the conventional means of approach to a special collection are lacking. Colleagues on the staff with longer experience than mine say they do not remember an "amateur publications" card file, despite the statement of such a file in the April 1936 *Library News*. Since the materials seem to be arranged alphabetically, my first impression is that identification for purposes of photo duplication should not be difficult.

In his letter to Oliner, Mr. Beck also noted that single issues of periodicals not otherwise retained by the Library of Congress were sometimes placed in a "Specimen File." So, the possibility exists that some elements of past donations of amateur journals to the Library of Congress may yet be discovered in the "Specimen File."⁵

⁵ The history of donations of amateur journals to the Library of Congress does point out the difficulty of preserving relatively small groups of amateur journals within much larger collections. Readily-accessible institutional collections of amateur journals like those at the American Antiquarian Society, the Western Reserve Historical Society, and the University of Wisconsin are all maintained in a "special collections" environment. The cost of cataloging and

maintaining such collections, particularly those involving large numbers of items, is high. While the writer (see *The Fossil*, January 2000) joined James M. Beck in proposing the Library of Congress as an ideal home for the Library of Amateur Journalism, additional reflection has led him to believe that such a donation could only be successful if a large endowment grant was available to support the cataloging and maintenance of the collection within a large institution subject to federal government budgetary constraints.

A new possibility soon emerged. On June 18, 1930, his eightieth birthday, Fossil Cyrus H. K. Curtis (1850-1932), broke ground for the \$5,000,000 Benjamin Franklin Memorial in Philadelphia, Pennsylvania. (Curtis was the publisher of *The Saturday Evening Post*, *Ladies Home Journal* and numerous other periodicals.) President Evan Reed Riale appointed a Library Committee consisting of Fossils Tilden, Curtis, Beck and McCain and this committee was continued in office by President Edwin B. Swift. As reported in *The Fossil* for July 1931, Howard McClenahan, Director of the Franklin Institute, met with Messrs. Curtis, Miller, Lee and Heuman in room 1302 at 150 Nassau Street in New York City on June 9, 1931. Mr. McClenahan was duly impressed by the value of the collection and accepted the tender of the collection by The Fossils in his letter to Charles C. Heuman dated June 16, 1931:

In accordance with our conversation during my recent visit with Mr. Curtis to the library of the Fossils, where I had the pleasure of meeting you and two other gentlemen, I wish to assure you that the Franklin Institute will be very pleased to receive your interesting library and to accept it under the following conditions:

We shall house it permanently in the new Benjamin Franklin Memorial; it will be kept intact and will be in its own separate alcove in the library of The Franklin Institute; it will be available for all those who are competent to use it for research purposes, as well as for the members of the Fossils. As far as may be possible, The Franklin Institute will keep it up to date and will add to it all appropriate material which we may be able to procure.

The New York amateurs remained reluctant to transfer the riches of the library to another city. In April 1923, Louis Kempner, who had served as Treasurer since the inception of The Fossils, and Joseph Dana Miller, who had served as Librarian since the acquisition of the library in 1916, traded places of the official board. Kempner resigned as Librarian in 1930 and was replaced by Fossil James Douglas Lee of the *New York Evening Post* (q.v., *The Fossil*, July 1930, p. 98). *The Fossil* for January 1931 (p. 134) listed Dion E. Woolley of Mount Vernon, New York as Librarian, while *The Fossil* for August 1932 (p. 220) reported that James Douglas Lee had resumed office as Librarian.

Michael F. Boechat's presidential message dated November 20, 1933 (*The Fossil*, January 1934) contained the next significant communication relating to the library:

For years the question of a permanent home for the Library has been uppermost in the minds of all Fossils. When it was finally agreed by the committee, Messrs. Tilden, Beck, Curtis and McCain, that the Franklin Institute offered an exceptionally fine opportunity for location and reference, it was with great pleasure that Mr. Heuman was able to close the agreement with Dr. McClenahan, Director of the Institute, to make the Memorial the final home of the Library. The only question then remaining, was the time for removal. The most opportune time seemed to be the time when the Institute was ready for it. Dr. McClenahan named the fifteenth of November as the time when they would be ready to receive it. With this clearly understood, the plans were made to clean, pack and ship to its destination this valuable, historical Library. Up suddenly came the voice of the Treasurer

[Joseph Dana Miller], who decided the removal of the Library, had been “indefinitely postponed.” No reason was given. Just the bare statement that it was postponed. As this was a complete reversal of the past three years planning and effort, some sensible or reasonable cause for this attempted repudiation of an agreement is due. The membership at large are still of the desire and wish the Library be removed to these more desirable quarters. The Franklin Institute will be visited by many thousands every year, and of these, the opportunity to consult the early work of men who have become famous, will be a valuable one indeed. The Fossils will keep their promise.

The official board when Boechat’s message was published in January 1934 consisted of President Boechat, Buffalo, New York; Vice Presidents Edward A. Oldham, Bernard A. Conolly, and John L. Dohme, all of New York, New York; Official Editor Charles C. Heuman, of New York, New York; Associate Editor, Sam S. Stinson, of Greenwood Lake, New York; Recording Secretary, Alvin M. Higgins, of New York, New York; Corresponding Secretary Harry H. Disosway, of Brooklyn, New York; Treasurer, Joseph Dana Miller, of New York, New York; and Librarian, J. Douglass Lee, of New York, New York. Both Heuman and Miller listed their addresses as 150 Nassau Street, the longtime home of the library. As recently as the official year ending in April 1932, the annual rent for room 1302 had been reported as \$300.00 (q.v., *The Fossil*, August 1932, p. 226). However, *The Fossil* for January 1934 reported rent for the official year ending in April 1933 as \$195, \$25 per month for May through September 1932 and \$10 per month for October 1932 through April 1933. An update through December 31, 1933 published in the same issue of *The Fossil* reported the rent for May through December 1933 as \$10 per month. Perhaps Treasurer Miller, in one final gambit to save the collection for New York, elected to subsidize the rent for the library’s quarters.

Edwin Hadley Smith reported on the development of the controversy concerning the library in *The Boys’ Herald* (vol. 62 no. 2) for December 15, 1933:

Charles C. Heuman last month repudiated his words, his agreement, and the work of the Library Committee—Tilden, Beck, McCain, and the late Cyrus Curtis—when, ignoring Franklin Memorial’s call for the Fossil Library and President Boechat’s plans to fulfill Heuman’s agreement, he assumed dictatorship of the Fossils and “indefinitely postponed” the removal.

President Boechat did not delay long in attempting to resolve the impasse. A special meeting of The Fossils was called for December 2, 1933, to be held in the Franklin Institute Annex in Philadelphia. The same issue of *The Boys’ Herald* printed William R. Murphy’s notes on the special meeting. One hundred one Fossils had granted proxies in favor of Edwin Hadley Smith. Eight Fossils—George W. Bertron, Michael F. Boechat, Frederick E. Ives, Louis Kempner, John G. Kugler, William R. Murphy, Edwin Hadley Smith, and William L. Washburn—attended the special meeting in person and withdrew their proxies. Three Fossils—James L. Elderdice, William Erler, and Minna Irving—sent proxies which did not arrive in time for the special meeting. So in all, Edwin Hadley Smith was controlled 94 of 101 votes—his own and 93 by proxy. An opinion by Fossil Louis C. Wills supporting the legality of the proxies was read. (Wills

had granted his own proxy to Smith.) Louis Kempner, George W. Bertron and N.A.P.A. President Harold Segal (attending the meeting as a guest) verified the proxies held by Smith. Smith moved, second by Ives, that the 1931 agreement between the Library Committee and the Franklin Institute be formally approved. The motion was carried unanimously, 101-0. Franklin Institute Librarian Alfred Rigling then appeared, re-stated the willingness of the Institute to accept the library, and offered the members a post-meeting tour of the Institute. Kugler then moved, seconded by Washburn, that the President be authorized to move the Fossil Library to the Franklin Institute without delay, taking legal action if necessary to fulfill the 1931 agreement. This motion was also carried unanimously, 101-0. The last Treasurer's report had appeared in *The Fossil* for August 1932. A motion calling upon Treasurer Joseph Dana Miller to render a new report was also carried unanimously. Kempner moved, and Murphy seconded, that President Boechat appoint a committee to identify the twenty-five incumbent directors called for by the Fossils' 1927 articles of incorporation. The motion was carried unanimously, and President Boechat appointed Louis Kempner, chairman, Louis C. Wills, and Alvin M. Higgins to comprise the committee. Thanks were then voted to the Franklin Institute for the use of their meeting room. Speaking for N.A.P.A., President Harold Segal stated that "the present-day amateurs would appreciate the chance to learn history from the Fossil Library under ideal conditions at the Benjamin Franklin Institute." George Herbert Randall, George R. Logan and other old-timers present as guests of The Fossils had intended to speak, but "the hour was late and the meeting adjourned to view the Benjamin Franklin Memorial under the escort of Librarian Rigling."

Smith continued his reporting on the library crisis in *The Boys' Herald* (vol. 63 no. 2) for January 20, 1934. President Boechat had met with Charles C. Heuman and Joseph Dana Miller in person on December 4, 1933, two days after the special meeting of The Fossils. The place of the meeting is not stated, but the headquarters of The Fossils in New York City seems the likeliest place. Of this meeting, Smith reported only that Heuman and Miller "raised excuses and technicalities to hold-up the library's removal to the Franklin Institute." We do not know the details of the arguments raised by Heuman and Miller, but they likely centered on the manner in which the Smith collection was acquired by The Fossils and issues relating to the corporate directorship of The Fossils, Inc. Subsequent to the meeting, Heuman requested that Boechat alter his message to the membership in the forthcoming issue of *The Fossil*; Boechat refused and Smith accused Heuman of holding up *The Fossil*. On December 23, 1933, Louis Kempner, appointed auditor by President Boechat, called at Fossil headquarters to examine the books. Smith reported that Treasurer Joseph Dana Miller, acting on "advice of counsel," refused to allow Kempner to examine the books. Smith also published comments from the newspaper press regarding the controversy over the library.

Smith updated his reporting of the controversy in a special "Repudiation Extra" number of *The Boys' Herald* (vol. 63 no. 4) for April 3, 1934. He reported first of all from a letter of Fossil "Dictator" Charles C. Heuman to James M. Beck dated January 27, 1934:

I wrote [President] Boechat some time ago that the library was at his disposition, and that if he felt that he had the legal right to take it away, there would be no opposition on our part.

President Boechat then had the library examined in Miller's presence by the Howard Trucking Company, which estimated \$45 for the packing and removal to Philadelphia. President Boechat sent an order for the removal on March 28; and Treasurer Miller, in receipt of the order, informed the trucking company on March 30 that packing could begin at 4 p.m. on April 2. The packers arrived as scheduled on April 2, accompanied by Fossil Eugene F. Pugh representing President Boechat. They were met by Fossils Charles C. Heuman, Joseph Dana Miller and John F. Walsh, Jr., who exhibited a letter from Fossil Librarian James Douglas Lee "disapproving" the removal. Asked by Fossil Pugh what he should report to President Boechat, Fossil Walsh replied "Tell him to go to ——!" Smith closed his "Repudiation Extra" number of *The Boys' Herald* by noting that the thirty-first annual business meeting of The Fossils was scheduled for 6:30 p.m. on April 28, 1934, at the Hotel Astor in New York City. He predicted:

The Fossils will pay their last respects to Brothers Heuman and Miller. The firing squad will officiate. Rest in peaces [sic].

Spencer's *History* gives the actual date of the collection's arrival and installation at the Franklin Institute as April 6, 1935, while Segal's *The First Hundred Years...* offers a somewhat different account:

The Franklin Institute actually accepted the collection on April 6, 1934, through its librarian Alfred Rigling. The collection then consisted of both the Fossil Library (items to 1915) and the National Amateur Press Association Library (items from 1931).⁶ These two were combined to form the Library of Amateur Journalism. The years 1916-1930 were not represented in either collection, so Smith set out to fill in the missing journals for those neglected years.

⁶ The N.A.P.A. librarianship is currently held as a lifetime office by retired professional librarian Stan Oliner. Edwin Hadley Smith gives an account of the office of N.A.P.A. librarian in the inaugural issue of his *Library News* (no. 1) for November 1935. The July 1889 constitution of N.A.P.A. created the office of librarian for the first time, and Leland S. Boruck was the first appointee (September 1889) to the office. *Library News* lists all the incumbents up through Smith's final appointment in March 1934, which he held for the remainder of his life. (Smith had previously held the office in 1894, 1903-1906, and 1910-1915.) The first attempt to assemble an actual collection of amateur journals failed when the collection donated by Edwin B. Hill in 1896 and stored by librarian Ella Maud Frye (1893-1896) was eventually lost. Thereafter, few incumbents of the librarian's office received journals from the membership or from their predecessors. If Segal's account is correct, the incumbency of Smith's predecessor librarian Walter M. Stevenson (1931-1933) was an exception to the rule. *Library News* (whole no. 3) for November 1936 contains an extensive listing of amateur journals 1915-1936 wanted by Smith for the collection. *Library News* (whole no. 4) for February 1939 and (whole no. 5) for October 1939 contain beautiful photographs of the collection as installed at the Franklin Institute.

It seems unlikely that Heuman and Miller, after having fought so hard to keep the library for the erstwhile Fossil headquarters in New York, would have conceded within days of the confrontation in room 1302 on April 2, 1934. They probably underwent the battering predicted by Smith at the annual meeting on April 28, 1934, of which no minutes appear ever to have been printed in *The Fossil*. Negotiations, perhaps between attorneys for Heuman and Miller and Fossil attorney Louis C. Wills, may have transpired. The library was probably finally removed from New York City to Philadelphia about a year after the confrontation of April 2, 1934, and installed at the Franklin Institute on April 6, 1935.

Even though the new official year began in April 1934, a new issue of *The Fossil* was not published until December 1934. It contained no detailed reporting of the fireworks which doubtless transpired at the annual meeting on April 28, 1934. In his presidential message in this issue, President Truman J. Spencer wrote as follows:

As I have mentioned Death entered our ranks, even invading our official staff, taking from us Corresponding Secretary Disosway and Director Jagger [whose collection had been the seed for Smith's]. Mr. Wills, owing to a pressure of duties, largely connected with his Presidency of the Brooklyn Chamber of Commerce, felt compelled to resign as a Director, and, in the interests of harmony, Editor Heuman and Treasurer Miller, voluntarily retired from official position, though retaining their membership.⁷ The Directors appointed Ed. A. Oldham Corresponding Secretary, Judge [Moses H.] Grossman and Eugene Pugh Directors, and persuaded Mr. Wills to accept the office of Counselor. Several prominent members, by reason of business cares or ill health, have felt compelled to decline appointments of Editor and Treasurer, and these offices are vacant for the moment.

Spencer's gentle words convey the result of what was doubtless a bitter struggle between the exponents of New York and the exponents of Philadelphia. The victory of the Philadelphia faction is made even more evident by the appointment of Edwin Hadley Smith of Washington, D.C. as Librarian. After an eighteen-year exile from management responsibilities relating to the library, Smith was back in the saddle. The idea of a library whose mission was limited to the preservation of amateur journals of the "golden age" had fallen by the wayside. Smith, then also serving as librarian for the National, was determined to bring the collection destined for the Franklin Institute back up to date from the point he had left off on December 31, 1915. The removal must have been a bitter defeat for Heuman, who had purchased the collection 1916 with

⁷ John F. Walsh, Jr., the other Fossil involved in the confrontation with Fossil Pugh and the packers on April 2, 1934, had died on August 14, 1934 (q.v., *The Fossil*, February 1935, pp. 7-8). David W. Jagger, who originally formed the collection which Smith acquired in 1898, died within a few days of Walsh, on August 8, 1934 (ibid., p. 9).

an entirely different mission from that of its founder Smith. In the same issue of *The Fossil*, James F. Morton issued an appeal “Let There Be Unity” including these words concerning the library:

As to issues, there are none to create the slightest bitterness. The Fossil Library has been placed in its permanent home, as all have wished, the division of opinion having been simply as to the manner of doing this. All have readily agreed in the reduction of the dues and in the alteration of the executive board to a more compact body, in a position to work more efficiently together. The president and the whole spirit of his administration have been from the beginning entirely non-partisan and devoted to unity.

The acrimony resulting from future disputes concerning the library, perhaps no more bitter than the disputes of 1933-34, unfortunately spilled over into the pages of *The Fossil*, even to the point of invective and *ad hominem* attacks. Spencer made sure that no such violations of common courtesy occurred during his administration. After leaving office as President, he served as editor of *The Fossil* for the next ten years, until his death in 1944. His are some of the most beautiful and informative issues ever published of *The Fossil*. Edwin Hadley Smith continued as Fossil Librarian until his death in 1944, when the office was assumed by his widow Nita Gerner Smith, who held it until she retired in favor of Bernice (McCarthy) Spink in 1955. The Smiths published *Library News* between 1935 and 1951, to keep amateurs updated concerning the library now housed in the Franklin Institute.⁸ The official opening of the library at the Franklin Institute occurred on April 6, 1935. Edwin Hadley Smith presided over the installation.

⁸ In remembrance of Mrs. Smith, N.A.P.A. Librarian Stan Oliner has continued to publish new issues of *Library News* from time to time.

The library as installed at the Franklin Institute maintained a low profile in the issues of *The Fossil* published between 1935 and 1964.⁹ Perhaps The Fossils believed that their mission of securing permanent preservation for the collection was accomplished. The amateur journalism collection of the American Antiquarian Society in Worcester, Massachusetts received more attention than the Franklin Institute collection in the pages of *The Fossil* during these years, including feature articles by Fossil Custodian Edward H. Cole in *The Fossil* for July 1945 and for April 1959. Cole was a member both of The Fossils and of the Antiquarian Society, and continued to enrich the collections of the Antiquarian after it received the Spencer bequest in 1944. Writing in *The Fossil* for April 1955, Edna Hyde McDonald commented:

We think the American Antiquarian Society is the logical repository for amateur papers and, what is more, we know it is the only place where we have been able to find readily what we were looking for. The collections at the New York Public Library, chiefly the Tryout Smith collection, repose in the original packets in the basement, gathering dust and of no use to any one. The New York Historical Society does keep its collection available and up-to-date and we recommend it to those who are interested.

With the information that the American Antiquarian Society was founded by a printer [Isaiah Thomas]—and one who put his equipment on a cart and trundled it to Worcester—haven't we really found a kindred spirit who, no doubt, still endows us with the same doughty courage and individualism?

The minutes of the Fifty-Third Reunion held in New York City on April 28, 1956 (*The Fossil*, July 1956) cited remarks by Edward H. Cole:

Mr. Cole referred again to the American Antiquarian Society of Worcester, the most noted research depository of amateur journals in the world, which now has the best and most complete collection of amateur papers anywhere, including that at the Benjamin Franklin Institute in Philadelphia. Mr. Brigham and his associate, Mr. Shipton, are interested and enthusiastic, and the collection is always available to any amateur wishing to inspect it, or to do research.

⁹ The first mention of the library after its installation at the Franklin Institute on April 6, 1935, occurs in the account of the thirty-second annual meeting held at the Hotel Astor in New York City on April 27, 1935, as published in *The Fossil* for September 1935. At this meeting, the members discussed whether the Library of Amateur Journalism as maintained at the Franklin Institute should be open to the public. Apparently, the vote was to restrict access to members of The Fossils, spouses of members of The Fossils, and members of N.A.P.A. The use of the terminology "Library of Amateur Journalism," as opposed to "Fossil Library" or "Edwin Hadley Smith Collection," is not a late development. From its very first issue dated November 1935, Smith's *Library News* described itself as the "Official Organ of the Library of Amateur Journalism."

Under the title “Fossils in the News,” *The Fossil* for April 1958 reported:

The American Antiquarian Society has completed an extensive card catalog geographical index of the thousands of amateur papers in its collection. President Clarence Brigham still looks forward to the time when the Society will be able to publish a bibliography of amateur publications. L. Verle Heljeson, a recent visitor to the Society, joins with the other amateur journalists who are familiar with the Collection at the Antiquarian in hailing it as the most sensibly arranged and easily accessible collection of amateur journals in any library. No amateur journalist should fail to mail the Society a copy of his paper so that the collection may be kept up to date. Address: American Antiquarian Society, Worcester, Mass.

Bernice M. Spink, wife of Helm C. Spink, had relieved Nita Gerner Smith as Fossil Librarian in 1955, and her name began appearing as Librarian in the officer’s roster with the January 1957 issue of *The Fossil*.¹⁰ Publication of Truman J. Spencer’s *The History of Amateur Journalism* by The Fossils in 1957 was one of the major events of the decade. Sheldon C. and Helen V. Wesson shepherded the landmark volume through the press while resident in Yokohama, Japan. Smith’s widow Nita Gerner Smith continued her active involvement in the hobby by collaborating with Nelson G. Morton on an index of *The History*, published in a separate volume by The Fossils in 1959. A report from Librarian Bernice Spink published in *The Fossil* for July 1958 makes some reference to the Franklin Institute collection:

As some of you may have forgotten, the unbound amateur papers in the Franklin Institute were sent to me a year ago. I expected to report at this time that the alphabetizing had been done and they’d been returned to the Institute. However, though it is almost completed, the job is not quite finished.

Before returning the papers I plan to check the better-known publications for missing numbers, and then try to secure these for the file. Though the papers have not yet been counted, I have measured them and find they will require ten feet of filing space.

Librarian Spink went on in her report to recommend that The Fossils adopt for the unbound amateur papers in the Franklin Institute the same kind of filing boxes used by the American Antiquarian Society for its amateur papers.

If the report from Bernice Spink was a gentle reminder of her continuing labors with the Franklin Institute collection, Stan Oliner’s article “Myths and Realities: The Fossil Library” in

¹⁰ The Fossil and N.A.P.A. librarianships appear to have been held simultaneously by Edwin Hadley Smith (1934-1944) and his widow Nita Gerner Smith (1944-1955). Bernice M. Spink also appears to have held both of the librarianships from 1955 until 1964, when Stan Oliner succeeded her as N.A.P.A. librarian. Mrs. Spink was not relieved as Fossil librarian until Leslie W. Boyer was appointed in 1967.

The Fossil for Winter 1964 was a real wake-up call. Perhaps the first of Oliner's "realities" was the starkest:

The Franklin Institute wishes to transfer the Library of Amateur Journalism, due to severe space factors in Philadelphia, and, probably, due to a lack of public interest throughout the years.¹¹

Pioneering Lovecraft bibliographer George Townsend Wetzel (1921-1983) of Maryland was one of the few researchers to consult the Franklin Institute collection during the 1950s. Oliner himself visited the Franklin Institute in January 1957 and found the collection languishing in a stairwell. In his article, Oliner listed the contents of the collection as updated through June 1943:

400 bound volumes of 38,000 amateur papers, 1750-1942
17 bound volumes of 2,800 newspaper-magazine clippings, 1867-1942
1,136 amateur books, 1828-1943
11 bound volumes, Richard Gerner collection
6 bound volumes of *The National Amateur*, 1878-1938
6 bound volumes of *The Fossil*, 1904-1934
The United Amateur, 1900-1942
2 boy presses, 1874 and 1881
3 silver loving cups
2 stone tablets
11 scrapbooks of 6,700 printed relics
6 cabinets (30 drawers) of 18,500 catalog cards
28 miscellaneous bound volumes
1 "Tomlinson gavel"
1 chair from 1936 convention

¹¹ As recorded in Harold Segal's centennial history of N.A.P.A. *The First Hundred Years...*, N.A.P.A. and Fossil librarian Bernice M. Spink received a letter from the Franklin Institute requesting removal of L.A.J. in April 1964. Mrs. Spink resigned as N.A.P.A. librarian because of her husband's ill health and Stan Oliner was appointed in her stead. At the Des Moines N.A.P.A. convention in July 1964, Edwin Harler, Harold Segal and N.A.P.A. librarian Stan Oliner were appointed a committee to meet with representatives of the Franklin Institute on the future of the library.

In addition the Franklin Institute collection included the Theodore G. Meyer's collection of puzzle papers, donated to Edwin Hadley Smith by the mother of William R. Murphy in 1936¹²:

- 13 volumes of puzzle papers, 1889-1901
- 4 scrapbooks of puzzle departments
- 27 volumes of *Golden Argosy*, 1883-1895
- 1 scrapbook of printed relics
- puzzle books

Oliner's first "myth" was equally as stark as his first "reality":

Myth: The collection will be readily accepted by another research library.

Citing space restrictions and costs, Oliner argued that a new institutional home for the Library of Amateur Journalism was unlikely to emerge. First the Foster Gilroy and then the Ernest Burton amateur journal collection "disappeared" in the massive files of the Library of Congress. The collections of Charles W. "Tryout" Smith and Charles W. Heins lay neglected in basement storage at the New York Public Library. The filing system of the American Antiquarian Society was not readily compatible with Smith's bound volumes.

¹² Edwin Hadley Smith also provided a description of the Meyer puzzle paper collection in *Library News* (number 4) for February 1939. The writer is unaware of the present whereabouts of the Meyer puzzle paper collection, which was apparently donated to the National Puzzlers' League when the Library of Amateur Journalism was removed from the New York University Library for microfilming in 1980.

In a report in the same issue of *The Fossil*, President Leland M. Hawes, Jr. recommended that The Fossils accept Oliner's offer to remove the collection from Philadelphia to Grand Junction, Colorado for a year of evaluation. The N.A.P.A. library committee consisting of Harold Segal and Ed Harler was to work with Oliner to prepare the collection for shipment. National President Tom Whitbread offered to subsidize half the cost of the removal. President Hawes also reported Librarian Bernice Spink's request to be relieved of her duties on account of the illness of her husband.¹³ In *The Fossil* for Summer 1965, President Hawes reported that a last-minute offer to take the collection had been received from New York University Library. However, after three months of deliberation, The Fossil board decided to adhere to its original decision to transfer the collection to Oliner. By the time *The Fossil* for Summer 1965 was published, the collection had been removed to Grand Junction, Colorado in Oliner's care. The National paid \$100 of the \$112 truck rental costs for the removal of the one-ton collection, leaving The Fossils with only \$12 of expense. Stan Oliner paid all his own travel and lodging expenses connected with the removal.

New developments concerning the library were reported in *The Fossil* for March 1967:

The Library of Amateur Journalism, formerly housed at the Franklin Institute in Philadelphia, and which more recently has been undergoing an overhaul and catalog updating by Librarian Stan Oliner in Wyoming, is now in a new home at the New York University Library in New York. The cost of this transfer has been borne by The Fossils, but it is expected that other amateur press organizations, as well as individuals, will contribute to this worthy cause. Periodic maintenance costs for the collection are expected to be paid by the hobby groups, and the University has assured us that the insurance will be handled by them, and that it will have the collection available for inspection by

¹³ The Fossils did not immediately honor Mrs. Spink's request to retire from her duties as Fossil librarian, although N.A.P.A. had relieved her of her librarian's duties in that association in 1964. At the 1966 Fossil annual meeting, Mrs. Spink suggested that the office of Fossil librarian be abolished on the grounds that there were no more duties to perform. (The library was then in the custody of N.A.P.A. librarian Stan Oliner.) However, Sheldon Wesson objected to the request to eliminate the librarian's office; he may have already been involved with the discussions which resulted in the library's transfer to N.Y.U. in 1967. For the discussions at the 1966 Fossil annual meeting, see *The Fossil*, March 1967, p. 4. Mrs. Spink was finally relieved of her duties as Fossil librarian and replaced by Leslie W. Boyer in 1967.

amateurs at all times. All Fossils can now be proud that this great collection is now in good hands, has been carefully cataloged and is ready for service to amateur journalists any time they visit New York.

The shades of Charles C. Heuman, Joseph Dana Miller and the other proponents of the 150 Nassau Street “key club” from 1916 to 1935 must have rejoiced to see the return of the library to New York City in 1967. Unfortunately, New York University ultimately proved to be no more successful than the Franklin Institute in providing a permanent home for the Library of Amateur Journalism. The Library lasted barely thirteen years at N.Y.U., as opposed to thirty years at the Franklin Institute. By 1980, the shades of Heuman, Miller and the rest of the “key club” would have to bid farewell to the Library a second time.

A feature article by Matilda Haywood entitled “The Library of Amateur Journalism Story” appeared in the next issue of *The Fossil*, dated Fall-Winter 1967. Final agreement between The Fossils and New York University Library to house the collection in the Fales Library (Special Collections Division) was reached on October 23, 1967. A reception to mark the new home of the library was held on September 30, 1967 and was attended by amateur journalists Leslie W. Boyer¹⁴, Sheldon and Helen Wesson, William and Matilda Haywood, and special guest of honor Nita Gerner Smith, widow of the collection’s founder. Dr. Theodore C. Grieder of N.Y.U. Special Collections, accompanied by his wife, Charles Gosnell, Director of the N.Y.U. Library, and Dr. Meyer L. Stein, head of the N.Y.U. journalism department, represented the institution.

The minutes of the sixty-fifth annual meeting of The Fossils held in New York on April 27, 1968 as reported in *The Fossil* for Spring-Summer 1968 contained additional details about the transfer of the collection to N.Y.U.:

The Custodian [Sheldon Wesson] reported on his work on the Library of Amateur Journalism, its transfer from Stan Oliner in Wyoming to N.Y.U., with the assistance of committee members Les Boyer of A.A.P.A. and Joyce Inman of U.A.P.A.. Bundles from these groups have been sent to the Library. The execution of a formal contract after the

¹⁴ Boyer had been appointed Fossil librarian to succeed Bernice M. Spink in 1967. Sheldon C. Wesson was appointed to succeed Boyer as Fossil librarian in 1971. While *The Fossil* is not definitive on the subject, William F. Haywood appears to have succeeded Wesson as Fossil librarian in 1973. Jeffrey H. Jennings was appointed as Fossil librarian in 1975, and served until Mike Horvat was appointed in 1980. Mike still holds the office of Fossil librarian. See the appendix for a listing of Fossil librarians.

transfer was reported.

Custodian Sheldon Wesson offered a further report on the library in *The Fossil* for July 1969. The National had matched the \$250 initial contribution of The Fossils toward maintenance of the library, and Custodian Wesson reported a total of \$520 in the library fund. Wesson reported that he would proceed with three additional steps to raise funds for the maintenance of the collection at N.Y.U.: (1) solicitation of contributions from U.A.P.A. and A.A.P.A.; (2) solicitation of contributions from individual amateur journalists; and (3) solicitation of governmental and private foundation grants. He also reported on discussions with Dr. Grieder on Lew Pryor's suggestion that individual items in the collection be loanable by inter-library loan to amateur journalists through their local libraries. In *The Fossil* for October 1969 Custodian Wesson reported that the immediate prospect for government and private foundation grants for the maintenance of the collection was not promising, but that plans to make items in the collection available through inter-library loan were progressing. The minutes of the April 1970 annual meeting in *The Fossil* for April 1970 reported on further efforts to accomplish fund-raising through the amateur press associations and Les Boyer's efforts to assemble A.A.P.A. material for the collection. Dr. Grieder recommended deferral of rehabilitation plans until the new building intended to house the N.Y.U. Special Collections was completed and the Custodian reported that a number of amateurs had volunteered to help sort and file newly-accumulated bundles of papers. The warning signs of the ultimate failure of the N.Y.U. experiment, lack of funds and lack of institutional commitment to the collection, were already beginning to emerge less than three years into the contractual arrangement.

In his Custodian's Report in *The Fossil* for July 1970, Wesson reported on amateur volunteers for the sorting of newly-arrived bundles of amateur papers and on a May 1970 meeting with Dr. Grieder in which a Saturday in August was set for the sorting. Custodian Wesson also solicited opinions from the membership on the best way of organizing the newly-arrived materials. Many past researchers had found the annual bound volumes for the years through 1942 difficult to use when trying to locate individual papers. The minutes of the April 1972 annual meeting as printed in *The Fossil* for October 1972 indicate that The Fossils were still holding \$520 in the library fund for expenditure when the N.Y.U. collection moved to its new quarters. In *The Fossil* for April 1973, Sheldon Wesson reported on a new meeting with Dr. Grieder, who anticipated removal of the collection to its new quarters, with more room for sorting, in March 1973. Wesson also reported that the puzzle component of the erstwhile Franklin Institute collection had not reached N.Y.U. and had apparently been transferred to the National Puzzlers' League. (Wesson anticipated a further report on this matter in the next annual meeting minutes, but in fact there was no mention of the Meyer puzzle paper collection in the minutes as published.) In the minutes of the April 1973 annual meeting as printed in *The Fossil* for July 1973, President Jeffrey Jennings reported that the Library of Amateur Journalism was expected to be removed to the new building at N.Y.U. in September 1973 and that Custodian William Haywood was planning an appropriate ceremony for the event. *The Fossil* for April 1976 reported that west coast Fossils Hyman Bradofsky, Harold Ellis and Gale Sheldon were planning a book of photographs selected from those removed from the Franklin Institute by Stan Oliner as a supplement to Spencer's volume *The History of Amateur Journalism*. Regrettably, this volume

was never published. The photographic component of the Smith collection was first donated to the Special Collections of the University of Kansas Library in Lawrence, Kansas, as reported by Lee Hawes in *The Fossil* for January 1981. Mike Horvat reported in *The Fossil* for January 1984 that tentative agreement had been reached with the University of Kansas Library for the photographic material to be transferred to the American Private Press Association Library in Stayton, Oregon.¹⁵

Just as Stan Oliner sounded the first alarm relating to the future of the library in his article “The Fossil Library: Myths and Realities” in *The Fossil* for Winter 1964, during the twilight of the library’s term at the Franklin Institute, it was Stan who first brought the problems confronting the library at New York University to the wide attention of the amateur world in *Library News* (number 12) for July 1976. Stan quoted from a letter received from Dr. Theodore Grieder dated June 2, 1976, in response to his request for loans of material for exhibit at N.A.P.A.’s centennial convention in Philadelphia in 1976:

...you know the agreement with the collection when N.Y.U. took it (the Library) was that it would not cost personnel time, binding costs, anything... Further, in the N.Y.U. economy drive, I am losing *all* of my staff... If one of your members wishes to come here with boxes and other packing material, pack the scrapbooks, and arrange for any pay for shipping, he is certainly more than welcome...

I in no way intend this statement as anything other than one of the original agreement under which we were willing to house the material and as one stating the case of our staffing.

A.A.P.A. President Leland Hawes, Jr. presented a reported on “The Library Dilemma” in *The Fossil* for July 1976, reflecting upon the discussion which took place at the A.A.P.A. convention in New York City in August 1975. The consensus of the discussion at the A.A.P.A. convention appeared to be that weekend amateur volunteers from the New York City area were the best hope to put the post-1943 component of the collection into order. Some amateurs were skeptical that sufficient funding could be found to have N.Y.U. graduate students perform the work. The actual agreement between The Fossils, Inc. and N.Y.U. was printed in *The Fossil* for January 1977 (p. 4). The agreement, signed on behalf of The Fossils by President Harold Ellis on September 30, 1967, transferred absolute title to the collection to N.Y.U. The Fossils agreed to provide clerical personnel for the sorting and cataloging of the collection and to pay for binding expense. In the event that N.Y.U. decided to dispose of the collection, The Fossils retained an option to regain possession, subject to responsibility for shipping expenses. In “Stalemate or Action—Now?” in *The Fossil* for April 1977, Ralph Babcock questioned whether the total library

¹⁵ The photographic component of the Smith collection does in fact today reside with Mike Horvat in Stayton OR.

fund of \$1,039 then accumulated from contributions by amateur press associations and individual amateur journalists could go very far in cataloging the loose material after 1943. Citing several microfilming projects relating to *The National Amateur*, Babcock was one of the first amateur journalists to suggest that some of the library fund be expended for preserving fragile and loose portions of the collection on microfilm. The April 1977 issue of *The Fossil* also introduced Martin M. (“Mike”) Horvat as a new member. Born January 16, 1946, Mike was an ardent science fiction collector and a Viet Nam veteran, and held a master’s degree in library science. Mike was to play a critical role in the future of the Library of Amateur Journalism.

Librarian Jeffrey H. Jennings (1919-2000) submitted a report on the library for publication in *The Fossil* for July 1977. The collection had by now been transferred to the Special Collections Department in N.Y.U.’s new library building. Librarian Jennings reported that Saturday volunteer sorting sessions were continuing. He also reported that some fragile material was being photocopied and that a satellite collection at Friends University in Wichita, Kansas was being considered. Librarian Jennings was also laboring over a proposed modification of the Dewey Decimal classification system—a topic not very closely related to the collection and its future. At The Fossil luncheon at the N.A.P.A. convention in July 1977 (reported in *The Fossil* for October 1977), both Custodian William F. Haywood and Librarian Jeffrey H. Jennings offered comments relating to the collection. Haywood emphasized the reality of N.Y.U.’s ownership. Jennings read his comments from an article which he had published in George W. Trainer’s journal *The Empire* (whole number 43 dated June 1977):

The special collection reposes as one row of 25 stacks in sumptuous third floor quarters of the spanking new N.Y.U. Library, Washington Square off Greenwich Village, New York City. The door is buzzer controlled, admittance is just to researchers, and includes card-carrying a-jays. The Fossils contracted the collection to N.Y.U. with certain reversionary control.

The late Edwin Hadley Smith was the moving force behind the present collection, which consisted of papers, journals, books, documents, artifacts, and other items printed by amateur non-professionals for non-commercial purposes. The Saturday Even Post’s Cyrus Curtis welcomed the collection “forever” to the Benjamin Franklin Institute Library in Philadelphia. An inspection by Jennings found it crowded in a corner with a cliff-hanging access. It was orphaned out. At that time, as President of The Fossils, Jennings had a hand in the transfer of the collection from the Franklin Institute to N.Y.U. Sheldon Wesson was chiefly instrumental in getting N.Y.U. for the library, and was an active assistant in transfer along with Stan Oliner.

The fear has been expressed that our collection may be relegated to the basement at N.Y.U. This is not the case, Jennings said, after he contacted Dr. Ted Grieder upon his appointment as Librarian for The Fossils. Dr. Grieder is Head of the Special Collections Section at N.Y.U., in charge of receiving material from The Fossils. He has looked at our material, is quite receptive, and has warmed to our situation. It is no longer likely we will be told to get our material out of N.Y.U. as they have an appreciation for our collection.

“The fact is,” Jennings said, “we are in great shape. The material is in good temperature and in a well-lighted room. We want to encourage all advances: with all systems Go.”

Librarian Jennings reported that he was devoting the first Friday of every month to preservation work. He invited other amateur volunteers to join him. At the same session, Gale Sheldon reported on progress on the project to publish a photographic companion volume to Spencer’s *History*. Librarian Jennings presented his next report in *The Fossil* for July 1978. He spent most of his report discoursing on various research projects facilitated by the collection and his own classification scheme, but did take note of Hyman Bradofsky’s \$1,000 donation to the library fund. Perhaps the strongest element of his report was its beginning:

Let us begin by what is meant by “librarian.” I am not a raker of desiccated leaves, nor a mortician formaldehyding some paper piles. Rather it’s a matter of respecting the past, attending [to] the present and projecting future development and use.

Clearly, the need to classify and house ongoing deposits was the biggest problem that The Fossils encountered with the collection at N.Y.U. Had The Fossils determined to limit the collection to the material bound and classified by Smith up through 1942, it seems likely that the collection might still reside today in its handsome quarters at N.Y.U. The responsibility for the cataloging of new deposits which The Fossils assumed under the 1967 agreement with N.Y.U. was the most problematic element of the agreement for The Fossils. It was a problem never satisfactorily resolved during the term of the collection at N.Y.U.

A lively discussion of the collection ensued at the annual meeting of The Fossils held at the Hotel Tudor in New York City on May 12, 1979, reported in *The Fossil* for July 1979. Debate continued over the use of the accumulated library fund. It was reported that Dr. Grieder felt that he could get part-time graduate student help in cataloging and catching up on index cards for \$3.50 per hour. Ted Schirm reported that security had been tightened following the discovery that many amateur journals containing contributions by or about H. P. Lovecraft had been stolen or vandalized. A Fossil membership card or a letter from Librarian Jennings was now required to access the collection. Edward Sherman Cole (1918-1988), the son of Edward H. Cole (1892-1966) and Helene (Hoffman) Cole, had lately returned to activity in the amateur journalism hobby after a long absence. At the 1979 annual meeting, Cole complained of the inaccessibility of the collection for most amateur journalists. He also commented on the commitment of N.Y.U. to the collection:

The agreement was a workable solution at the time but we have no guarantee as to its durability. They have an option [to dispose of the collection] which they can exercise at any time. It is like holding a shotgun at your head which may discharge when they run out of space. The personnel may be very nice now, but in the academic area as in corporations this may change. We haven’t got a tiger by the tail. It is like riding on the back of a big animal that is ambling along and can come to a stop at any time. We need to be prepared for such an emergency. But we are not alone here, whatever we do must be submitted to the membership.

The annual Fossil luncheon held at the Cincinnati, Ohio N.A.P.A. convention on July 2, 1979 as reported in *The Fossil* for October 1979 brought several additional points to light. Helen Wesson reported the grim news “that every scrap of Lovecraft material has disappeared from the Fales Library at the New York University Library, scavengers even purloining papers in which he was only mentioned.” Matilda Haywood reported that Librarian Jennings, absent because of illness, was continuing to work with N.Y.U. on the collection and asked that all contacts with N.Y.U. be made through Jennings. Former Fossil President Leland M. Hawes, Jr. provided an extensive report on the collection at N.Y.U. in *The Fossil* for April 1980. Hawes cited Stan Oliner’s *Library News* (number 12) for July 1976 for the information that budget cutbacks at N.Y.U. had resulted in the elimination of all institutional support for the maintenance of the collection. Dorothy Swanson, Head of N.Y.U. Special Collections, replied to Hawes’s inquiries as follows:

On behalf of New York University Libraries I thank you for your concern and interest in the maintenance of The Fossil Collection.

As I mentioned in our phone conversation, the agreement with the Fossils was that they would take responsibility for arranging, indexing, binding and rebinding.

The library did do this work until a few years ago when a reduction in the Special Collections staff made it impossible for us to continue.

Your offer of a contribution to permit us to again undertake maintenance of the Fossil Collection is very gracious. Any funds that you might contribute will be applied exclusively to the Fossil Collection, and you may regard this letter as evidence of our commitment to use the funds solely in the manner you desire.

If you need any additional information or wish to discuss the matter further, please do not hesitate to contact me. Naturally, any contributions to New York University Libraries are tax deductible.

Hawes made a gift of \$2,000 to N.Y.U. for the maintenance of the collection on July 31, 1979. This was later joined by an additional gift of \$2,000 from an anonymous donor. In his report, Hawes also mentioned the potential interest of the University of South Florida in Tampa in the collection.¹⁶

¹⁶ The University of South Florida eventually became the home of William F. Haywood’s amateur journalism collection and is the destined home of Hawes’s own collection.

On April 26, 1980, Edward Sherman Cole was elected President of The Fossils at the annual meeting held at the Tudor Hotel in New York City. He was to remain in office until Dick Fleming was elected President in April 1985. Cole came into office with the strong opinion that the N.Y.U. agreement crafted by Sheldon Wesson had failed. He was determined to find a new, private home for the collection. As discussions continued, differences of opinion flared into fierce controversies, fueled by the animosity between Cole and Wesson.¹⁷ Custodian William F. Haywood (1915-1999) and his wife Matilda S. Haywood (1917-1989), together with Librarian Jeffrey H. Jennings, advocated the idea that the collection should be microfilmed in its entirety before transfer to any new home. The annual meeting in April 1981 was the culmination of all the controversies. Sheldon and Helen Wesson left The Fossils in exasperation with the attacks on them.¹⁸ William F. and Matilda S. Haywood endured nearly an equal level of rancor, but stuck with the organization. In fairness, it is clear that President Edward Sherman Cole acted out of a strong personal sense of obligation to the collection. Since Wesson was the heir to the major part of his father's amateur journalism collection, perhaps he perceived that his own voice should be the final one regarding the disposition of Smith's collection.

Discussion of the collection once again dominated the annual meeting of The Fossils held at the Hotel Tudor in New York City on April 26, 1980, as reported in *The Fossil* for July 1980. The minutes as recorded by Secretary Ruby Quillman record the following discussions:

Custodian Haywood read a letter from Leland Hawes in which he related of a visit to the N.Y.U. Library [during which he] had talked to Dr. Grieder, Curator, and Dorothy Swanson, Head of Special Collections. They made it plain that the University would be unable to carry out the terms of his contribution made six months earlier to upgrade and preserve the Collection. Despite assurance then of the University's continued interest to serve as repository for the Collection, Dr. Grieder and Mrs. Swanson now raised the question of other potential sites. Man-power limitations make it impossible to upgrade the Collection even with his contribution, they stated. They cannot let students work in that area without faculty supervision because of the close proximity of valuable and rare books, and faculty supervision is unavailable. Though they set no deadline and indicated there was no rush, it was evident that time was running out at N.Y.U. Now is the time to explore the possibility of alternative sites. He would suggest to the members at large that

¹⁷ The animosity between Edward Sherman Cole and Sheldon Wesson was extreme and even percolated into unfortunate exchanges in print in *The Fossil* in 1979-80. Cole felt that Wesson had acted inappropriately in offering his father's a-jay correspondence files to Brown University. The university ultimately returned almost all of these files to Edward Sherman Cole, who destroyed them because of their perceived personal content. In fairness to Cole, he did donate the letters of H. P. Lovecraft to members of the Cole family, which his father had kept separate from his general a-jay correspondence files, to Brown University.

¹⁸ Ever a gracious and broad-minded lady, Helen Wesson elected to re-join The Fossils in 2003.

if they have knowledge of any other site that would be interested in having the Collection, to let the officers know.

President Cole presented his views of the situation regarding his personal visit with Jennings to the Library the previous afternoon. He found the Collection behind tight security having to be let in through three locked doors. He was unable to see Dr. Grieder but questioned Ms. Swanson as to how many had been in during the past year to use the Fossil Collection, and though she didn't have her records she was quick to respond, "None." So the problem resolves into promoting interest in the Collection or cause it [to] have more appeal.

Librarian Jennings proposed microfilming the association mailings beginning with January 1980, and a motion to do so was made and carried. The filming cost was quoted as approximately \$60 per year for each association's bundles. In *The Fossil* for July 1980, Librarian Jennings announced the availability of the A.A.P.A., B.A.P.A., N.A.P.A., U.A.P.A. and U.A.P.A.A. mailings for the first half of 1980 on microfiche for \$12.50 per set. The contractor was Micropublishing International of South Haven, New York.

In the same issue of *The Fossil* (July 1980), President Cole reported to the membership on the future of the collection. He reported on three proposals: (1) filming of the entire collection under the supervision of Jeffrey Jennings's daughter Sharon, who held a master of library science degree, as proposed by Librarian Jennings; (2) transfer of the collection to the Special Collections Department of the University of South Florida, as proposed by Leland M. Hawes, Jr.; or (3) transfer of the library to a private amateur journalist custodian, as proposed by Mike Horvat. Horvat's proposal is worth quoting in its entirety:

Dear President Cole,

I am writing to offer my services for the maintenance and preservation of The Fossil Collection.

With the help of Fossils Willametta Keffer, Joe Bradburn, Hyman Bradofsky, Victor Moitoret, and other collectors inside the 'Dom, I have been (generously) given quite a few journals of the past. I have read them with an intense interest...and seen enough to realize their worth and the desirability of their preservation.

I have talked this matter over in great detail with my wife and my attorney. I make the following offer being, I think, aware of the magnitude of the task:

A) I offer space for The Fossil Collection in the entire second story of my home, approximately 1600 square feet (five rooms).

B) I will gladly give generously of my time in putting the collection in order. I will see to it that the collection is fully cataloged.

C) I will provide the services of a professional librarian (holding a Master's Degree in Library Science) for between ten and twenty hours per week during the first year to assure that the collection is properly established.

D) I will set up a private foundation at my expense to assure that such donations as that recently made by Lee Hawes may be made to The Fossil Collection with no question of its eligibility as a tax deduction. I will enable The Fossil Collection to receive papers (as well as cash) under this tax credit plan, helping to assure that The Fossil Collection will continue a healthy growth.

E) I will administrate the collection without recompense; all donations will go strictly to maintaining the collection itself.

A collection such as The Fossil Collection needs to be in the hands of amateur journalists—not librarians. An institution will **not** provide the care and development that such a collection deserves. I am sincere in my offer and do not make it lightly.

MARTIN M. "Mike" HORVAT

Horvat's offer coincided with President Cole's own feelings about the collection. From the first, Horvat's offer had the inside track with Cole and his administration. Cole's 1980-81 official board consisted of himself as President; Matilda S. Haywood as First Vice President; Ruth Travis Gobeille as Second Vice President; Russell L. Paxton as Official Editor; Ruby A. Quillman as Secretary-Treasurer; Martin M. (Mike) Horvat as Librarian; and William F. Haywood as Custodian. In *The Fossil* for October 1980, President Cole reported on the deliberations concerning the library. Cole described the strong recommendations for Mike Horvat's proposal that he had received from Vic Moitoret, Ralph and Alf Babcock, and Ruby Quillman and announced his appointment of Mike as Librarian, replacing Jeffrey H. Jennings. He then described his own thoughts on the future of the library:

Draft No. 2 involved discussion of the pros and cons of Horvat's proposal (July *Fossil*). Its history recommends against entrusting The Fossil Collection to another university library; it is not in context with any special library collection discovered to date. Bluntly analyzed, a library institution is similar to a supermarket and cannot afford shelf-space for unattractive items. Both Franklin Institute and N.Y.U. have demonstrated the inevitable process; someone in AJ oversells the virtues of the Smith Collection to an agent of the library and it is accepted with great expectations—from which high-point the library becomes increasingly disenchanted and the arrangement deteriorates to the dismal status witnessed at N.Y.U. Expecting altruism from a professionally staffed library is an excursion into the World of the Tooth Fairy.

Cole then responded to the critics of "individual" curatorship for the library:

A substantial minority of respondents, mostly those expressing undocumented arbitrary

opinions, opposed entrusting the Collection to an “individual.” Why not? It was assembled and nurtured by an *individual*, Hadley Smith. Under his devoted administration it became *the* record of amateur journalism, unmatched at this writing. The Collection is a treasure *only* to amateur journalists and cannot compete against higher priority items in an university library. It requires immediate attention, if it is to be preserved and properly cataloged before its more fragile papers crumble beyond any possibility of restoration; it commands the dedication of an amateur journalist comparable to Edwin Hadley Smith. It is the collective opinion of those who know him best (and my exchange of letters with him compel including myself) that Mike Horvat is the most apparent and likely successor to Hadley Smith manifest in this generation of amateur journalists.

Cole then described a telephone call which he received from Jeff Jennings and Bill Haywood, seeking approval of a transaction they had negotiated with Dorothy Swanson of N.Y.U. and International Micropublishers to film the entire collection at no cost to The Fossils. The gifts of \$2,000 each from Lee Hawes and from an anonymous donor would finance the cost of the filming. All that was required to proceed was approval by N.Y.U. (still the legal owner of the collection) and by The Fossils, Inc.

Writing on September 13, 1980, President Cole described in his message the decision which he reached the prior day. He received written communications from Second Vice President Gobeille and from Secretary-Treasurer Quillman stating their votes in favor of accepting the Horvat offer. Cole telephoned Official Editor Paxton and received his verbal approval of acceptance. He was unable to reach First Vice President Matilda Haywood and Custodian William Haywood by telephone. However, his own vote, combined with those of Gobeille, Quillman, and Paxton made 4 votes in favor of accepting Horvat’s proposal. That made a majority of the 7-member official board in favor of accepting Mike Horvat’s offer. From this moment on September 12, 1980, President Cole considered the decision concerning the disposition of the collection final. There remained only its implementation. Cole concluded his report:

Under the administration of the Horvats [Mike and his wife Susan], the Collection will be back in the amateur journalism environment where it certainly belongs. Although this world is full of uncertainties, the future of the Collection has, at last, the promise intended by its founder. Mike Horvat personifies the Hadley Smith devotion to amateur journalism and reverence for its artifacts. Amateur journalism and The Fossils are fortunate that Mike Horvat is a member, whose devoted concern provided solution at the moment of most acute need.

There are other matters of concern to members of The Fossils, but resolution of the Library problem had precedence. I am grateful for your letters, copies of old AJ publications enlightening me on the character and historical background of the Smith Collection and your efforts on behalf of The fossils. I particularly thank Ralph Babcock for reporting on his visit to the Horvats to inspect the excellent facilities proposed for housing the Smith Collection.

President Cole wished to implement the decision of his official board swiftly. But discussion of the proposed transfer of the library to Mike Horvat continued. In the same issue of *The Fossil* (October 1980), Dick Fleming raised the issue of insurance protection against fire and theft. However, he strongly supported the Horvat offer and considered that the library would be more accessible to members than it was at N.Y.U. or could be at the University of South Florida (the site proposed by Lee Hawes). Ted Schirm reported on a visit paid to N.Y.U. with President Cole and Librarian Jennings the day before the 1980 annual meeting. He related Dorothy Swanson's insistence that appointments in advance were necessary to use the collection. However, First Vice President Matilda Haywood and Custodian William Haywood expressed differing opinions in their article entitled "Time to Consider Relocating the Library of Amateur Journalism." They stated that the Cole board had approved the microfilming of the collection by Micro-Publishers International. The Haywoods argued for more consideration before the library was turned over to Mike Horvat:

Let it be understood immediately that we have nothing against Mr. Horvat personally. We have corresponded with him and find him to be an enthusiastic collector, one who seems anxious to assume managership of the Library of Amateur Journalism. However, we are dismayed to hear him compared to Edwin Hadley Smith. Smith devoted a lifetime, and most of his substance, to the collection and sorting of amateur papers. Horvat joined *The Fossils* only four years ago, and has been a member of N.A.P.A. for the same period. Attending his first convention at Kennewick in 1978, he was appointed Librarian of The N.A.P.A. This appointment in itself would seem to create a conflict of interest.

The Haywoods concluded by arguing that the University of South Florida and other possible custodians should be given further consideration.

In *The Fossil* for January 1981, Lee Hawes published a written offer to house the collection from J. B. Dobkin, Special Collections Librarian at the University of South Florida in Tampa (dated December 3, 1980). He acted after President Cole concluded a letter to him dated August 10, 1980 by writing: "I wish to approach likely repositories for the Collection." However, Cole's fundamental views concerning the collection were reiterated in his letter to Hawes dated June 7, 1980:

What motivated my approaching you was a marked similarity in our analysis of what constitutes necessity—the Collection *must* be transferred to an amateur journalism environment.

In the same issue of *The Fossil*, President Cole summarized the transactions of the official year relating to the library:

As principal officer, I feel this to be the appropriate time for expressing member appreciation to those who have made extraordinary contributions over the past year. Leland Hawes' generous donation (April issue, *The Fossil*), which was applied to microfilming the Smith Collection and his assistance in negotiating the release of the

Collection to Martin (Mike) Horvat's Library certainly falls in this category. Jeffrey Jennings' successful effort to arrange both the current microfilming project with N.Y.U. and Gemgraphix and negotiate its financing also deserves our commendation. Too, Joseph Bradburn's assistance in establishing Horvat's Library and his recent donation, starting a fund to meet the expense of moving the Collection to Oregon, have been substantial contributions toward starting a viable Library of Amateur Journalism. Our highest accolades belong to Mike Horvat, himself, for volunteering services that will require many long hours of dedication, to the preservation of the history of amateur journalism.

If Cole hoped that agreement to film the collection before transferring it from N.Y.U. to Mike Horvat would resolve the continuing controversy concerning the board's September 12, 1980 acceptance of Horvat's offer, he was to be disappointed.

Cole returned to the issue of the library in his presidential message in *The Fossil* for April 1981. He reported that his solicitation of opinion concerning the library in *The Fossil* for July 1980 had resulted in twelve responses, eight in favor of Horvat's proposal, two in favor of an institutional library, one in favor of continuing with N.Y.U., and one of divided opinion (later resolved in favor of accepting Horvat's offer). He described the decision to approve microfilming of the collection and the acceptance of Horvat's offer as one board action. He then proceeded to report on further developments relating to Mike Horvat's offer:

Excepting a minority of the Directors, no objection to the majority decision was registered over a three-month interval to publication of *The Fossil*, January 1981 issue, either by communication with the officers or letters to the editor. During this time, an agreement was negotiated whereby the Smith Collection will be administered by a Foundation, established by Martin Horvat in accordance with his published offer.

The agreement provides that the Foundation shall retain the Collection for the duration of its existence and, in the event it should be dissolved, return the Collection plus everything acquired during the period of Foundation administration. The Foundation is forbidden to diminish, sell or encumber the Collection with liens. A member of the Foundation administrative body is to be appointed by The Fossils, providing both awareness and reasonable control of policy as it influences the Collection. A periodic report on the status of the Collection is to be provided for publication in *The Fossil*.

Cole's words are probably the most succinct description of the agreement between The Fossils, Inc. and Mike Horvat's private foundation, which eventually emerged as the American Private Press Association (A.P.P.A.).¹⁹ The foundation ultimately took the form of an Oregon not-for-

¹⁹ The writer has been unable to find any copy of the custody or deposit agreement between The Fossils, Inc. and A.P.P.A. Reference to it may also be found in Jeffrey H. Jennings' comments at the April 1981 annual meeting of The Fossils, Inc. Even Mike Horvat of A.P.P.A. was unable to provide the writer with any copy of this agreement.

profit corporation, which received not-for-profit recognition from the Internal Revenue Service for tax purposes on October 24, 1980. When The Fossils, Inc. were reorganized as an Oregon corporation in 1985, its articles of incorporation provided that the library would pass to A.P.P.A. upon dissolution of The Fossils, Inc. as a corporate entity. Details concerning the governance of A.P.P.A. were never published in *The Fossil*. Cole concluded his remarks with another lengthy argument in favor of private custodianship by an amateur journalist, as opposed to institutional custodianship. He criticized the agreement with N.Y.U. as providing The Fossils no recourse when the theft of the H. P. Lovecraft materials in the collection was discovered. Libraries are notoriously leery of giving any publicity to thefts from their collections. Given the limited number of visitors to the collection while it was housed at N.Y.U., it is probably true that the Lovecraft materials might have been recovered if N.Y.U. had promptly reported the thefts to the Federal Bureau of Investigation.

In *The Fossil* for July 1981, Official Editor Paxton began a four-part reprint of Charles W. Heins's article on the Smith collection, originally published in *The Boys' Herald* for September 1908. It was intended that a current Fossil member provide an update to the series, but no update was ever published. The only things lacking in *The Fossil* reprint of Heins's article were the remarkable illustrations which accompanied the article in *The Boys' Herald*. The photograph of the collection as it was shelved at the Pratt Institute Free Library in Brooklyn in 1908 is particularly poignant, especially now that the card catalog index of the bound components of the collection has been lost.

The same issue of *The Fossil* reported on the contentious annual meeting of the organization held at the Hotel Tudor in New York City on April 25, 1981. In his presidential message, President Cole described it as "a singularly unedifying affair," but Secretary-Treasurer Quillman's minutes report it nearly blow-by-blow. The meeting began with extensive discussion of the filming of the association bundles for the first half of 1980. The most controversial aspect of this was the fact that N.Y.U. received a set of the fiche, while The Fossils did not. Former Librarian Jennings reported that the two \$2,000 donations to N.Y.U. from Hawes and an anonymous donor would pay for the filming of the entire collection. The contractor, Howard Diamond of International Micropublishers, failed to show up for the annual meeting as promised. Jennings reported that Diamond was delaying shipment of some original materials to Librarian Horvat until receipt of payment from N.Y.U. Matilda Haywood criticized the nominating procedure for the 1981-82 official board²⁰, but the elections proceeded with Cole returned as President. Then Matilda dropped her bombshell:

There are two items I'd like to bring before the group, the first one is: I would like to move that we poll the total membership about where they would like *The Fossil*

²⁰ Matilda S. Haywood had served as First Vice President during the first Cole administration in 1980-81 but failed to be slated for any Fossil office for the next year by the nominating committee. She launched a "write-in" campaign for the presidency for the 1981-82 term, but was defeated by Cole.

Collection to go, whether it is to go to Southern Florida University or to Mr. Horvat.

Matilda's motion was seconded by Patricia Jennings. Cole ruled the motion out of order on the basis on the board's prior agreement with the "Horvat foundation." He acknowledged that Ralph Babcock and Joe Bradburn had both changed their positions since the board reached its decision, but argued that they were very strong in their support of the Horvat offer before the board acted. Matilda countered:

Now you are challenging us. You said that if we could get a bona fide offer by January, which we did, and that's what made Ralph and Joe change their minds because they did not know such an offer existed. Furthermore, you have said in letters to us, that you have received from various members, never mentioning how many, that you polled the membership and they were in favor of this foundation. I would like to know exactly how many people are in favor of this foundation. I have 20 letters saying they would like to see the collection go to Southern Florida and to let the membership decide and not the President.

Cole defended the decision of his board, despite a vigorous challenge from Jeffrey Jennings. Secretary-Treasurer Quillman reported that the agreement between The Fossils and the Horvat Foundation ("the deed") reserved ownership to The Fossils, but Jennings criticized the incompleteness of the copy available at the annual meeting and stated that he could not possibly vote for approval. Cole responded that such approval was unnecessary, since the board had already ratified it. The rancor of the discussion continued to increase, with Jennings accusing the President of giving the collection to himself, and Matilda Haywood calling the President's actions "high-handed." Custodian William Haywood was more level-headed in the concerns which he expressed about private curatorship:

On the Foundation or some other name, I don't know whether it is the Horvat Foundation to which we are turning over the collection with Mr. Horvat the principal officer. Is this close [to] being accurate, as far as the Membership of the Board of Directors of this foundation, that it consists of one member appointed by The Fossils? If that is the case, how many other people constitute this Board of Directors, if it is more than two other people? I don't know what Mr. Horvat's intentions are but if he were to name five people, they could be members of his family, it could be completely out of our control. It might be difficult to get it back all the way from Oregon. To me the whole situation is unimportant as I have felt all along that the important thing has been accomplished in the efforts of Mr. Hawes, in seeing that the entire collection, before it disintegrates, was put into microfiche.

If the preservation of the collection on microfiche before dispatching the original materials to Mike Horvat seemed to offer hope for the resolution of controversy, the hopes were soon to be shattered. Editor Paxton reported on Librarian Horvat's frustration with Howard Diamond in his editorial in the same issue of *The Fossil*. Diamond put Horvat off with the statement that he could only accept direction from Jennings and Haywood. The file cabinets from the Smith collection had arrived in Oregon, but all but two were empty. Editor Paxton asked for a full accounting of

the microfiche transaction. President Cole provided his own perspective on the situation in *The Fossil* for October 1981:

Another plan is (temporarily) in limbo. The Library of Amateur Journalism, for which Mike Horvat established a foundation, last year, is anticipated as a focal point for publicity and a reference source for amateur journalists and students seeking insight into the hobby. The material (Smith Collection) was removed from the Special Collections Library of New York University over a year ago on the pretense of being microfilmed by a company known as Gemgraphix, then located in South Haven, N.Y. (Long Island). Ms. Dorothy Swanson, Head of Special Collections (N.Y.U.) instructed Gemgraphix to ship the material to the Horvat Library on completion of processing. Apparently, the company still has the Collection, and has produced no evidence that microfiche processing has been performed. When proponents of this project solicited approval by the Board of Directors, three weeks was specified as the time for processing (in September, 1980).

Cole complained that Gemgraphix “has no established business in the library reproduction field and the Smith Collection is its first attempt.” He contemplated in print asking his board to take legal action against Gemgraphix and its insurer, Great American Insurance Company, and advised all the amateur press associations that The Fossils had no agreement to receive royalties from Gemgraphix reproductions.

President Cole reported to the membership in *The Fossil* for January 1982:

Mike Horvat is assembling surviving parts of the Smith Collection as a nucleus of a viable Library of Amateur Journalism, barely reaching the point of achievement targeted for this time, last year. There remains much to be accomplished in an atmosphere of apathy, which, itself, must be dissipated, if The Fossils, Inc. is to re-establish its lost prestige. There are some of the factors of anticipation.

Retrospection tends to sully enthusiasm for what lies ahead. It would be outright hypocrisy for me to greet the members with forgiveness for those who deliberately conspired to undermine efforts to revitalize this organization over the past several years. I recollect that proponents of the ill-fated microfiche project put their integrity on the line when seducing the Board of Directors to accept what was pretended as a legitimate transaction between Gemgraphix and New York University, then expressed umbrage when efforts to protect the interests of The Fossils were initiated. The deliberate looting of the Smith Collection, a monumental loss to amateur journalism, was systematically covered up with *false reports* in *The Fossil*, and delivered *verbally* to the Annual Meeting. The monstrous dimensions of this coverup make it impossible to be the least bit charitable, even at the Season, in which this is being written. Nor is it in me to overlook the lack of concern on the part of those, who did not wish to “become involved” in the effort to rescue Smith’s papers. The loyalty and perseverance of the Directors commands my gratitude, but there is little else in the past year to be recollected pleasantly.

In retrospection, I still smart from the surly treatment accorded me at the Annual Meeting. A roomful of members sat in silence while the meeting was constantly disrupted by ceaseless, abusive monologue against the administration and its policies. Despite the manifest evidence that Jennings neither would nor could answer questions dealing with the status of the Smith Collection, the members accepted the fiction that all was well and the mythical microfiche copies were only hours away from completion. No one seemed bright enough to observe that the Gemgraphix brochure circulated around the room listed *only* Smith's papers as indication of the company's pretended library reproduction business. Not one word of truth was uttered by proponents of the Gemgraphix transaction despite the pretense of fervent sincerity. Whatever the excuses told the members, Howard Diamond's chief compulsion for being absent was his total lack of capability to perform processing of our Collection. He had performed none of the work his agents claimed was nearly completed. Gemgraphix went out of business. Nor was there any agreement with N.Y.U. making delivery of microfiche copies a contingency for release of the Smith Collection to The Fossils; it was to be returned with no strings attached so far as New York University is concerned.

A nondescript microfilm processor owned by a man, named Sheldon Gertler, obtained part of the Collection from Gemgraphix, and attempted to sell reproduction of selective parts for the original sum (\$4,000). Jennings and Gertler presented this modified proposal to Ms. Swanson, Head of Special Collections at N.Y.U. Library. Lincoln said, "You can fool some of the people some of time..." and they tried. Ms. Swanson turned them down after consulting with The Fossils and instructed Gertler to ship the material to Mike Horvat.

Gertler disclosed that the Collection is scattered; some of it evidently held for ransom by a sub-contractor, and other parts "being returned from Baltimore" (?). It is apparent that the various people sponsoring and otherwise involved in this travesty managed in a matter of months to destroy a substantial part of Edwin Hadley Smith's life work. Compounding the problem is the lack of basic records, from which to derive a reasonable inventory of what Jennings and Diamond took from N.Y.U. Smith's index file would be the logical source of such information, but Gertler reports that the cards were "stolen" from the trunk of Diamond's automobile. Considering the history of this *coverup*, the news does not come as a revelation

The microfiche project has been aborted. When an evaluation of the loss to Amateur Journalism has been made, an effort to recover damages from those responsible will be initiated.

What of the loss of the \$4,000 fund donated to N.Y.U. by Leland Hawes and an "anonymous" member to fund this project? The donors were duped with the same fraudulent misrepresentations as submitted to the Directors of The Fossils. At last report the fund was still held by N.Y.U. It is hoped that no one sent money to reserve subscriptions to the Gemgraphix scheme advertised by Jeffrey Jennings.

Despite the barrage from President Cole, the roster of The Fossils as published in *The Fossil* for July 1982 still included Jeffrey & Patricia Jennings and William Haywood. The Wessons and Matilda Haywood had dropped. If the microfiche project was a failure, President Cole, re-elected to another term at the annual meeting in April 1982, did not fail to rub salt in the wounds. In his presidential message in the same issue of *The Fossil*, Cole once again commented on the library:

In retrospect, events of the past two terms of office tarnished whatever gratification to be derived from the honor under normal circumstances. The damage and losses inflicted on the Smith Collection as a result of my permitting myself to be duped into endorsing an unlikely project purporting preservation of the papers cannot be translated into anything tending to embellish amateur journalism. Some of Smith's papers are still being held for ransom by subcontractors, who performed work neither included in the original project specifications nor authorized by The Fossils, and are seeking payment from the processing company. Many bindings are broken, fragile papers torn, the entire index-card catalog lost and pages defaced with notes as evidence of indifferent treatment accorded the Collection since removal from New York University Library. No microfiche processing was ever performed despite to the contrary by those presuming authority over the work and their efforts to sell "subscriptions" to a non-existent service.

In the same issue of *The Fossil*, Librarian Horvat presented his own report. Horvat reported that after one year he had been able to learn that the collection had been divided between Mr. Diamond and a sub-contractor located in Baltimore. He complained that the Baltimore portion of the collection had been defaced with large codes written on every page, and that one-third of the older bound volumes had suffered severe damage. In addition, he stated that one of the 400 numbered bound volumes of amateur journals and all the volumes of *Golden Argosy* had apparently been lost. Horvat reported receiving twenty-two boxes since the beginning of 1982. He foresaw the major tasks as organizing what he had already received and continuing to press for delivery of the remainder of the collection. He recommended that The Fossils consider a lawsuit against Gemgraphix or N.Y.U. to seek indemnification for the damage suffered by the collection.

President Cole reported further on the library in his message in *The Fossil* for October 1982:

For the first time since the mid-1960s we are meeting our obligation to preserve the Library of Amateur Journalism in a manner which can be defined and measured. We have direct contact with the material and reasonable control over its administration as a viable library by specific agreement. This contrasts sharply with the previous arrangement, whereby the Collection assembled by Edwin Hadley Smith was donated as an outright gift to N.Y.U. with no prerogatives reserved for The Fossils. That agreement included the right of the recipient to retain whatever it deemed valuable and to discard the balance, The Fossils only having the choice of accepting or rejecting return of the residue. Although it was popularly believed there was a way in which amateur journalists could contribute to the cost of servicing the Collection and funds were donated for this purpose by the several

associations, this had no foundation in fact. N.Y.U. had neither personnel nor expertise in the subject (amateur journalism) to enable constructive servicing of the Library of Amateur Journalism to be performed. The papers were inaccessible to those seeking access as a number of amateur journalists have reported. During the sojourn at N.Y.U., all Howard P. Lovecraft material was looted from the Collection. Due to the peculiar system employed by Smith, the Library of Amateur Journalism lacked professionally acceptable cataloging to make research by name or subject possible. Without such cataloging the limited personnel at N.Y.U. could not extract information in response to inquiries. The material lay dormant, unused and remote to amateur journalists until 1980 when it was removed and sent to microfiche processor, ostensibly for reproduction. N.Y.U. returned ownership to The Fossils.

The microfiche project was a fiasco. The fund collected to provide library services for Smith's papers was used to retrieve them from the inept processing company and its subcontractors, in this way achieving its intended purpose. Most of the Collection is now in the hands of The American Private Press Association, a non-profit foundation established by Martin M. Horvat for the specific purpose of providing preservation and upgrading of the thousands of papers comprising the Library of Amateur Journalism.

Despite protestations of opponents to our placing this treasure of a history under the administration of an individual amateur journalist, the Directors and a majority of members resolved that it was fitting to locate the Smith Collection in an environment where it commands highest priority, similar to the circumstances under which it originally flourished, the care of a dedicated and knowledgeable amateur journalist.

Third party (Ralph Babcock) reports verify that the monumental task of indexing the Collection according to professional library standards is well in progress and for the first time since Edwin Hadley Smith relinquished control of the papers, The Library of Amateur Journalism is [in] a stage of development. Our agreement with Mike Horvat provides close contact with the material, reasonable participation in administration and return of the Collection to The Fossils should The American Private Press Association ever become defunct. In return, we are assured of safe storage, access to the Collection by an accredited member of the community of amateur journalism and services which no academic or professional library could possibly render.

By the time Cole penned his message for the January 1983 issue of *The Fossil*, shipment to Horvat was mostly complete and rancor seemed to be ebbing:

Reconstruction of the Smith Collection at Mike Horvat's American Private Press Association Library continues with the assistance of Ralph Babcock, who reports favorably on accomplishments in restoring the papers. Mike plans on publishing a report in the near future, pending more material organization of the chaos finally extracted from the microfiche fiasco in New York. In keeping with the vote of the Board of Directors of The Fossils, Inc. the Special Library Fund has been turned over to Mr. Horvat's foundation

in fulfillment of its original dedication to servicing the Smith Collection. While a substantial part was used in legal and shipping costs incidental to recover[y] of Smith's papers, there was a substantial balance to be used constructively to defray costs in restoring the Collection. Both projects are in a transient state, but there is every reason to believe they maybe precisely defined by mid-spring and their separate contributions to amateur journalism brought into sharp focus in the next issue of *The Fossil*.

Cole provided a further report as promised in *The Fossil* for April 1983:

Mike Horvat's task cannot be as clearly defined as the "Showcase" project. [The latter resulted in the publication of *Your Thoughts* by Ralph Babcock in 1983.] Dick Fleming visited both Mike and Ralph in his recent tour of the United States and reports that the Smith Collection is emerging from chaos to a memorable degree. When I inspected the papers at N.Y.U. in April, 1980, I considered the work involved to adequately classify and catalog the material as awesome, roughly in the vicinity of 1,000 hours. During discussions with the Director of the Library, \$150,000 was bandied about as a rough estimate of the sum necessary to perform this work with professional help, although it was generally acknowledged that N.Y.U. lacked expertise in the history of amateur journalism essential to the task. That Horvat has managed to line the shelves of one room with sorted, cataloged material in the interval since receiving the material, late last year, is most reassuring. His continued dedication to amateur journalism and its cherished artifacts commands our highest commendation. This is, truly, a priceless contribution to the history of amateur journalism and epitomizes the dedication of The Fossils.

What must be emphasized is a reversal in the trend toward deterioration plaguing the Library of Amateur Journalism since it left the direct administration of Edwin Hadley Smith, terminating in the near-disaster at the hands of the nefarious microfiche processor (Gemgraphix). Horvat is negotiating with other amateur journalists to replace missing parts of the Collection and is pursuing other procedures for enhancing, as contrasted with simply preserving, Smith's papers. He is handicapped by the loss of Smith's original index file, materially adding to my original evaluation of work involved in establishing a library discipline. The Fossils are deeply indebted to Mike Horvat for his devotion to this Herculean task.

Cole was re-elected to another term as Fossil President in April 1983. Writing in *The Fossil* for July 1983, he reflected again on the library:

We have salvaged The Library of Amateur Journalism from obsolescence and inaccessibility. Although losses inflicted during its devious route from New York University to The American Private Press Association Library substantially increased the amount of work necessary to restore it to the status envisioned by Edwin Hadley Smith, it is in the hands of a knowledgeable and dedicated amateur journalist, finally. Its restoration will be sympathetically treated from the viewpoint of amateur journalism, not something interpreted from an academic concept of social trend expression or other preconceived

theory lacking expertise in our hobby and the participants.

With the delivery of the remaining components of the collection to Stayton, Oregon in late 1982, the Horvat era of the library had really begun. In the January 1984 issue of *The Fossil*, Mike Horvat offered his own report, dated January 11, 1984. He reported on the merger of the offices of Custodian and Librarian and his receipt of seventeen cartoons of material from former Custodian Willametta Keffer. Horvat also reported that donations from Vic Moitoret and Joe Badburn had made possible the binding of the A.A.P.A. and N.A.P.A. official organs and that he himself was engaged in sorting U.A.P.A.A. bundles. In addition, he reported that money originally donated by Lee Hawes and an anonymous donor to N.Y.U. for support of the library had been received by A.P.P.A. Horvat also reported that the collection was now housed in three rooms in his home.

The April 1984 issue of *The Fossil* appeared under the editorship of Ralph Babcock, who reported favorably on the work of the Librarian in a feature article entitled "What About The Library of Amateur Journalism? And Who IS This Martin Horvat?" Babcock related Horvat's strenuous efforts to rescue the collection from the bankrupt Gemgraphix and its subcontractor. Based on his own personal visits, he described the care which the library received in the Horvat home, as well as providing a verbal sketch of the Librarian and his family. He concluded: "Truly, it looks like the Library finally has 'found a home' and a caring custodian to cope with EHSmith's collectomania." Another warm portrait of Mike Horvat, recounting a surprise visit to the Moitoret home in Silver City, New Mexico, was contributed by Vic Moitoret to *The Fossil* for April 1985. Both Babcock and Moitoret were justifiably impressed with Horvat's hard work and dedication. Elected for yet another term (his last) in April 1984, Cole reflected only briefly and retrospectively on the library in his president's message in *The Fossil* for October 1984. His major concern now was the reincorporation of The Fossils, since fulfilling the requirements of New York corporate status (first obtained in 1927) had become unwieldily. In *The Fossil* for April 1985, President Cole reported on the re-incorporation of The Fossils, Inc. as an Oregon not-for-profit corporation as of March 25, 1985. The articles of incorporation provided for an Oregon resident agent and for transfer of ownership of the library to A.P.P.A. in the event that The Fossils, Inc. ceased to exist. President Cole also reported that Librarian Horvat had obtained a grant from the State of Oregon to support the work of the library. The Librarian's report in the same issue of *The Fossil* reported on new organizing efforts. Mike Horvat provided a bit of history and news of an important new development:

The journals prior to 1943 were bound under the supervision of Edwin Hadley Smith. From then until the mid-fifties, his wife, devoted amateur journalist Nita Gerner Smith, filed journals alphabetically in special boxes which she had made. Through handling, I suppose, many of these have gotten out of order. They are all being put aright and meshed into one continuous alphabetical file with those journals that we have up to the time (in the mid-sixties) in which they are still in bundles as received.

Vic Moitoret has completed a tremendous project for the Library of Amateur Journalism; he has made photocopies for us of his card catalog of amateur journals. With the loss of

the 40,000 cards that were typed by (or for) the Edwin Hadley Smiths, the Fossil Collection was rendered relatively unreferrable; if you did not know the year of publication and title of a journal, it was impossible to find it. Now, thanks to Mr. Moitoret, we may follow an individual's progress, from year to year and title to title.

In July 1985—the first annual meeting of The Fossils held in conjunction with an amateur journalists' convention—President Cole finally relinquished the reins to his successor Dick Fleming. In his “valedictory” published in the July 1985 issue of *The Fossil* Cole still dished out praise and blame:

Martin M. (“Mike”) Horvat's dedication to amateur journalism cannot be too highly praised. Few people are aware of the humiliations to which he was subjected during the year-long effort to extract the Edwin Hadley Smith Collection from Gemgraphix, the company Jeff Jennings and William Haywood had represented as eminently capable of producing the entire library in microfiche. His constancy and patience in retrieving what remained from this fiasco after the fly-by-night microprocessing company went out of business deserves the appreciation of the entire AJ community. Because the entire index system (approximately 50,000 3x5 cards prepared by Smith) was “stolen” from Howard Diamond's automobile while the Collection was allegedly being processed by Gemgraphix, we will never know how much actually was lost between N.Y.U. and Horvat's Library, but the considerable amount of material that survived is the product of Mike's efforts. He has discharged all of his promises made to The Fossils when soliciting care of Smith's papers and this contribution, alone, is monumental. Our debt does not end there, however, because Mike provided a solution to our problem of incorporation, this Spring, and generously permitted The Fossils to identify with our Library in Oregon on a long-range basis.

The October 1, 1985 membership roster of The Fossils no longer included Jeff and Pat Jennings, but William F. Haywood remained. Neither Jennings nor Haywood was ever invited to contribute his views on the microfiche project for publication. Perhaps having borne with President Cole's attacks over a period of years, they would have opted for silence even if offered the opportunity to respond.

With the 1985 reincorporation in Oregon, the Horvat era had begun in earnest. The articles of incorporation were dated March 25, 1985 and listed directors Edward Sherman Cole, Eunice M. Fontenot, Betty B. Millar, Ruby A. Quillman, Ralph Babcock and Martin M. Horvat, of whom Cole, Fontenot and Quillman signed as incorporators. Martin M. Horvat was shown as resident agent. The purpose of the corporation was stated to be “to preserve the history of and foster activity in amateur journalism.” Article V of the Articles of Incorporation read as follows:

The provisions for the distribution of assets on dissolution or final liquidation are: The principal asset of The Fossils, Inc. is the Edwin Hadley Smith Collection of amateur journalism, presently assigned to The American Private Press Association. In the event of final dissolution of The Fossils, Inc., the Collection shall become the property of The

American Private Press Association and any residual funds in the treasury shall be delivered to said Association toward perpetual care of the Collection.

The Fossils seem to have breathed a collective sigh of relief once the long controversies concerning L.A.J. were put to bed and the collection was entrusted to Mike Horvat. The next decade of *The Fossil* contains only occasional notices of the library. Probably the most notable developments ensued as a result of the deaths of Martin B. (1902-1989) and Willametta (Turnepseed) Keffer (1906-1989) in an automobile accident in May 1989. (Mrs. Keffer was killed instantly but her husband survived her for several weeks in a coma.) A prolific writer and publisher, Willametta had saved every publication and letter from her the inception of her involvement in the amateur journalism hobby in the late 1930s. In addition, she was the recipient of many prior amateur journalism collections, including those of Harry E. Martin and Burt Foote. N.A.P.A. Librarian Stan Oliner first inspected the remaining collections at the Keffers' Shady Acre home in February 1990 at the behest of the Dominion Trust Company of Roanoke, Virginia, executor of the will of Martin B. Keffer. He noted the unfavorable conditions in the home—the furnace and the basement sump pump had been turned off—and began the separation of personal and hobby material. Through the ensuing nine months Oliner and Mike Horvat worked closely with the estate—there were thirteen different heirs—to secure permission to remove the amateur journalism material from Shady Acre. Permission was finally secured in October 1990 and within two weeks Stan and Mike flew to Virginia to undertake the arduous packing and shipment of the Keffer amateur journalism collection. In a week's time, they packed 137 boxes and shipped over six thousand pounds of material. Because of the moisture pervading Shady Grove, much of the material was silverfish-infested and had to be fumigated upon receipt at Stayton, Oregon. Some material stored in the basement and in a storage shed was unsalvageable. Stan recounted the rescue mission in detail in *The National Amateur* for September 1991. Mike Horvat made his own two-part report "Our Journey to Roanoke" in the issues of *The Fossil* for January and July 1991. The second part of Mike's report provided a financial accounting of the rescue mission. Total expenses of \$4,043.33 were met by fifty-four separate amateur contributors, ten of whom donated \$100 or more. (The largest single contributor was Stan Oliner himself, who donated frequent flyer airline tickets for himself and Mike Horvat valued at \$1221.00.) The Keffers left a \$2,200 bequest to N.A.P.A., of which \$1,000 was donated to The Fossils, \$450 to A.P.P.A. for preservation expenses related to the Keffer collection, and \$750 retained in the N.A.P.A. treasury to cover in part the expense of the memorial issue of *The National Amateur*.

Historian Guy Miller touched on the library in his remarks "Striding or Staggering?" in *The Fossil* for October 1989. After reviewing the history of the collection in brief, Miller commented on financial support of the library:

The Library originally operated from a special library fund which, when it was turned over to the A.P.P.A. foundation, amounted to \$1,582.67 (*The Fossil*, Jan. '83). The state of this fund and sources of income have not been publicly detailed since, so far as I can determine. But one assumes that, in addition to grants, financial help still comes from private donations. (I can find no record of support from any of our ajay groups, including The Fossils, since 1981.) Of especial note is the donation of \$2,000 made by Lee Hawes

when the library was still housed at N.Y.U.

Reflecting upon the future of the library, Miller commented:

Of course, we realize that most of the progress we see is due to the work of one mortal. But, such has always been the history of any cause in amateur journalism. The miracle is that whenever Duty has whispered low, "Thou must," there has been someone around to reply, "I can." So may it ever be. In any case, if only for this brief hour, let us be boastful of the fact that the Library of Amateur Journalism is resting more securely than at any time in its now long history. One of the challenges to members of The Fossils should be to assure that the stability which Mike Horvat now provides so expertly will be perpetuated. I dwell on this extent on the Library of Amateur Journalism, not only in reaction to our detractors, but also as emphasis of the fact that, if for no other reason than this purpose, The Fossils, Inc., composed of members from all the ajay organizations, has a need to survive.

In *The Fossil* for July 1994, Librarian Mike Horvat published both his regular "Librarian's Report" and a more extensive "Report On the Library of Amateur Journalism, 1993." In his regular report, Horvat commented on the loans from L.A.J. on display at the Smithsonian Institute exhibition "The Boy and His Press." As a perquisite of the loans, the Smithsonian performed repairs on a hand press loaned by L.A.J. Horvat reported further that he was keeping the Keffer collection separate from the Edwin Hadley Smith collection, since the earlier journals in the Keffer collection did not lend themselves to be interspersed with the bound volumes (pre-1943 component) of the Smith collection. In his longer report, Horvat reported on the sorting of the earlier components of the Keffer collection, which "temporarily" occupied one full room in his home. The section of his report entitled "What the Library Contains" offers a useful update to Stan Oliner's nearly thirty-year-old description (1964):

The cornerstone of the Library's collection is that material amassed and organized by Edwin Hadley Smith, consisting of bound volumes of amateur journalism, 1854-1941. From then on, the collection contains some miscellaneous issues filed by title, and then bundles as the a.j. groups switched to this form of distribution.

I have added a collection of privately printed material that does not fall into the mainstream of amateur journalism, but has the same roots and structure. This material is filed alphabetically by title and accounts for some 150,000 items.

The Keffer Collection contains a wealth of privately printed books of the 1930-1990 era which were not in the Library. These are mostly poetry with some typography. These are not cataloged yet. It also has a large selection of papers from the era 1870-1940 which will enhance the Library's collection immeasurably. These are what I am working on now. Willametta also had an extensive accumulation of her correspondence, both what she received and copies of her replies. This is an untapped treasure that will allow us to eventually "flesh out" the personalities of ajayers of the past and enable us to keep their

memories alive much more vividly.

There are many more small wonders contained in the Library: an audio tape of a convention, treasurer's and secretary's notes from various associations, awards and banners from a.j. political campaigns of the past, etc.

Under the heading "How the Library Is Housed," Horvat reported:

The Library of Amateur Journalism normally occupies two rooms. It takes up three, temporarily (as I assure my wife), during the sorting of the Keffer Collection. One room is long and fairly narrow, allowing a row of file cabinets on each side of a five-foot walkway, approximately 22 feet long. Down the left side of this room is a row of four-drawer filing cabinets. Above the filing cabinets are brick and board supports for the standard, three feet deep banker's boxes which extend up to the ceiling. Along the right side is a similar board arrangement with banker's boxes from floor to ceiling. There is an alcove at the head of the room for items not yet sorted or for things (like photographs) which do not lend themselves to "standard" size box storage.

The adjacent room contains primarily hardbound material. I have put as much of this in the old Globe sectional oak bookcases as I can. This lends a dignity and sense of age to the collection. I have wedged a desk in here as well, plus four more filing cabinets. I have framed some of the photos and have them hanging in this room: the 1916 and 1940 meetings of The Fossils, a snapshot of Edwin Hadley Smith in the Presidents' Field, and the second convention of the National Amateur Press Association. On display are some small presses from the 1880s, brass pica poles, wooden composing sticks and engravings.

The Library is open virtually anytime, by appointment. I don't get too many ajayers stopping by, but have been quite pleased to see Jeff Jennings, Laurence Hines, Dick and Beulah Fleming, and an occasional other over the years. The Library has been used in person four times in recent years by scholars who, typically, spend three or four days here doing research. A few requests and inquiries come in by mail. I have seen to it that the Library is listed in scholarly reference publications, which gives us some exposure in that quarter.

When The Fossils held their annual meeting in Eugene, Oregon on August 15, 1995, in conjunction with the A.A.P.A. convention, Mike Horvat had the opportunity to showcase the library for the members in attendance. A generous photographic supplement which accompanied *The Fossil* for October 1995 contained several shots of members touring the library, where they were welcomed by Mike and Susan Horvat. Regrettably, an unsuccessful five-year experiment in the prefabricated housing business soon dramatically reduced the time which Horvat could devote to the library. In 1998, Fossil President Joseph Snodgrass appointed the writer to the office of Fossil Historian, to replace Daniel F. Graham. Guy Miller, Snodgrass's successor as Fossil President, asked the writer to prepare a series of discussions on L.A.J., to try to stimulate awareness of this important charge. These written discussions were circulated privately to a small group of amateur journalists strongly interested in the library. The first report, dated October 15,

2000, discussed preservation; the second, dated October 17, 2000, accessibility; and the third, dated October 19, 2000, succession. A fourth discussion, dated October 29, 2000, contained a model institutional transfer agreement, whereby journals would become the property of the depository institution as cataloged and made available for use. In addition, the writer discussed the library in his Historian's column in *The Fossil* for January 2000 and published *A Survey of Institutional Collections of Amateur Journals* in December 1999.

N.A.P.A. Librarian Stan Oliner and the writer presented a panel on L.A.J. at the N.A.P.A. convention in Wilmington, Delaware in July 2001. Mike Horvat sent Oliner two reports on L.A.J., both of which Stan read to the convention. The two reports were subsequently published in *The Fossil* for May and November 2002. In his first report, Horvat reported on the physical relocation of the library. He explained:

The Library is now in its own rooms in the Paris Woolen Mill [Stayton, Oregon]. The Mill is no longer in use but is rather the home of several non-profit community services. The Mill is on the National Historic Register and is an appropriate home for the collection. I am paying rent and utilities out of my pocket for now.

Horvat also reported on his efforts to obtain a University of Oregon graduate student to assist in cataloging as part of a thesis project; to distribute archival-quality copies of amateur journals to local historical societies; to establish an Internet presence at www.amateurjournalism.com; and to replace H. P. Lovecraft material stolen from the collection during its stay at New York University Library. Horvat's second report, published in *The Fossil* for November 2002, is worth quoting in its entirety because it capsulizes his vision for the library:

The importance of the Library to the Fossils as an organization is clear; it epitomizes our dedication to preserving the memory and relics of our avocation.

I appreciate the recent writings of Ken Faig and others as they stir up our thoughts. It is essential that we keep the future of our Library uppermost in our minds. It is said that each generation must rewrite history in light of its own experiences. It has been twenty years since our "great debate" on how to best care for the Library and prepare it to continue down through the years as a resource for the future and as a living memorial to the fine amateur journalists of the past.

Some felt that the Library was safest in the hands of an institution which would incorporate it into their collection and provide professional care and development. The institution, being above the limited lifespan of an individual, would assure us of the Library going on into the future. Others felt that, given the past performance of institutions that had the Library, it was necessary for the Library to become an institution of its own, guided by an amateur journalist who would maintain focus on the Library. The latter concept prevailed and the Library was given over to my care in 1982.

The past twenty years have been a time of preservation. I applied for grants over the years. The local ones were successful. The national ones were not. My interpretation of

conversations with the national grant secretaries convinced me that there was little interest in the world at large for our special collection.

The time has finally come in my life, as I approach retirement, when I can devote more effort to the Library. At the same time, my personal experiences during the last five years have taught me a good deal about thinking big.

Thinking big; what a concept!

What does our Library need to preserve it and develop it? First, it needs a permanent home that belongs to it so that it cannot be “evicted”; it should not be held in trust by anyone. With all the good wishes in the world we have seen institutions tire of the collection and begrudge it space or individuals die. Second, it needs a full time staff to take care of it. Third, it needs to let “the world” know of its existence. Fourth, it needs a source of income to pay for ongoing needs.

We Fossils have never thought of the collection as important enough to stand on its own.

It is time we knew it.

To this end I have hired a fundraiser, Archival Resources, Inc., of Pennsylvania, who will raise money for the purchase of land and a building, for the development of an adequate Internet presence, and for the establishment of a trust fund whose interest will be available for paying ongoing expenses of the Library (salaries, utilities, taxes, and the like). Additionally, I have also hired a consultant whose expertise lies in grantwriting to approach the fund-raising problem from another side.

It is essential that we realize the unique value of the Library and that we convince others of its importance. Our literate heritage is essential to understanding the social and intellectual growth of our country in the post-Civil War era. As amateur journalism changed and matured, it became a record of the beliefs of a segment of the population otherwise unrecorded. The gifts we have to share with the world are great.

It is time the world knew it.

Change has never been slow in affecting the Library of Amateur Journalism. The Library will once again lose its home before June 1, 2003, when the Paris Woolen Mill is scheduled for demolition. Mike Horvat has advised President Miller of his intention to take the Library back into his home. In addition, Mike Horvat has reported that the fundraising agreement with Archival Resources proved to be unsatisfactory after he and A.P.P.A. expended \$2,000 to initiate the fundraising effort.

Nevertheless, these words of vision from Mike Horvat should challenge every member of The Fossils to contemplate to importance of L.A.J.. Whether Horvat’s vision of an independent,

self-standing institution (almost akin to the “bungalow” Edwin Hadley Smith once wanted for his collection) is capable of realization, only the future will tell. If a new institutional solution is to be contemplated in the future, experience has taught us that a *permanent* commitment to house the collection is necessary, as is assurance of adequate funding for the preservation and development of the collection. The loving care which Horvat has provided for the collection for the past twenty-two years of its existence speaks for itself. He has spared no expense or labor when the future of the collection has been at stake, witness the rescue of the Keffer collection and the rent and utilities for the library’s Paris Woolen Mill home which he paid out of his own pocket. The 1980 decision of Edward Sherman Cole and his board to commit the library to Horvat’s care has been vindicated on many fronts. Now that Mike Horvat has sold his printing business and retired, we may justifiably hope for twenty or more “golden” years of advances for the library under his care. As the membership of The Fossils ages and declines in number, our concern must be to assure that A.P.P.A. has all the tools in place necessary to assure the continuing preservation and development of the collection when the Horvat era inevitably comes to an end at some point in the future. When and if The Fossils surrender their corporate charter in Oregon, L.A.J. will become the property and responsibility of A.P.P.A.

Mike Horvat was kind enough to furnish the writer with some information regarding A.P.P.A. It is an Oregon not-for-profit corporation, originally organized in 1980 and recognized by the Internal Revenue Service as a not-for-profit organization under Section 501(c) of the Internal Revenue Code on October 24, 1980. The Oregon corporate registration of A.P.P.A. was inadvertently allowed to lapse in 1998-2002, but was revived in 2003. Two thousand shares of stock are authorized and five hundred have been issued to Martin M. Horvat. The A.P.P.A. board, which meets informally twice per year, currently (2003) consists of Horvat; Frank Denton (retired college librarian), Seattle, Washington; Dale Goble (retired printer), Stayton, Oregon; and John Bullis (high school media specialist), Boulder City, Nevada. Article IX, Sections 7 and 8 of the A.P.P.A. corporate by-laws provide as follows:

Section 7. Library: The contents of the Library may not be sold. In the event of the disposal of the Library it shall be offered in toto first to The Fossils, Inc., an Oregon Corporation. The Fossils, Inc. shall have six months to make arrangements for its removal; in the event that six months are not adequate, the Corporation will not deny a request for a reasonable extension. If the Librarian is notified in writing by the Chairman of the Board of Directors of The Fossils, Inc., that The Fossils, Inc. do not wish to accept this offer, the Librarian is free to use his discretion as to whom the Library may be offered, provided only that it be an organization formed under the provisions of IRS Code 501c.

Section 8. Dissolution: In the event of the dissolution of this Corporation, any funds left after paying all legitimate bills of the Corporation shall be given to The Fossils, Inc. In the event that The Fossils, Inc., is no longer the funds will be given to an organization organized under the provisions of IRS Code 501c whose goals compliment the goals of the Corporation.

Article V Section 7 of the A.P.P.A. by-laws describe Mike Horvat’s duties as Librarian:

Section 7. Librarian: The Librarian shall care for and preserve the Library of the American Private Press Association. He shall make such recommendations to the Board as he deems necessary for the development and preservation of the Library.

It does not seem likely that The Fossils, as an organization, will survive to celebrate in second centennial in 2104. The amateur journalism hobby itself is changing, and some of its participants question its own ability to survive. Fewer and fewer young men and women are becoming hobby printers; in fact, the expense of any form of paper publication has become so great that many have fled to electronic publication as their medium of choice. Before the Internet existed, there were few mechanisms for the ordinary man or woman to express his or her opinions or feelings in print. Amateur journalism was almost unique in providing such an outlet from the mid-nineteenth century onward. Just as family historians devote their energies to the preservation of the lives of the ordinary man and woman, we may hope that cultural historians will eventually recognize the unique value of amateur journals as written records of the thoughts and aspirations of the ordinary man and woman. This is not to deny that the hobby never provided a home for extraordinary individuals—the list of them would be long—but nevertheless it is the work of the many which is predominantly represented in our library.

The writer is not without hope that Mike Horvat will be successful in realizing his vision for L.A.J. and that by 2104 The Edwin Hadley Smith Memorial Library of Amateur Journalism will be a prosperous institution in Stayton, Oregon, visited regularly by cultural historians from around the world. An alternative future might see L.A.J. housed and adequately cared for in an institutional library which would not dare to enrage its patrons by disposing of, or neglecting, any precious relic of the amateur journalism hobby. Harry Potter we will always have with us; on the other hand the scholar of 2104 searching for an amateur journal produced in a few hundred copies between 1850 and 2000 is likely to have only a few good candidates for finding what he needs. The author hopes that in 2104 the Library of Amateur Journalism will be the first and foremost of those candidates. Edwin Hadley Smith and Martin M. Horvat both devoted considerable portions of their lives to the preservation and development of this unique collection; Horvat's contribution is ongoing and Stan Oliner runs a close third in overall effort expended on behalf of the library. We should not forget all the other amateur journalists (and for that matter the professional librarians) who have expended their energies on behalf of the library; nor should we forget donors like Leland M. Hawes, Jr. and all of those who contributed to the rescue of the Keffer collection in 1990. Recording their names and their contributions has been a major objective in writing this history.

The writer is well-aware that some readers may regard this entire monograph as a churning-up of past controversies which might have been better forgotten. That tempers flared and harsh words were exchanged, even in print, over the Library of Amateur Journalism cannot be denied. However, the writer believes that a knowledge of the past is essential for sound future decisions regarding the library. If you believe that the library belongs in an institutional library, you need to be aware of its history at the Pratt Institute, Columbia University, the Franklin Institute, and New York University. If you believe that the library belongs with private amateur

journalist custodians, you need to be aware of its history at 150 Nassau Street in New York City and in Stayton, Oregon. If you believe that the Library of Congress or the American Antiquarian Society are the best potential future custodians for the library, you need to be aware of The Fossils' past relationships with these organizations. If you believe that digital or microform reproduction is the way to make the library more widely available, you need to be aware of the experience with Gemgraphix.

The centenary of The Fossils in May 2004 also marks the approximate centenary of the Library of Amateur Journalism. It was in February 1903 that Edwin Hadley Smith resigned his insurance company clerkship, to devote his entire energies and financial resources to the cataloging and development of the library. The library has been the proudest possession of The Fossils, in many ways the principal reason for our continued existence, since Charles C. Heuman acquired it for us in March 1916. The library has come a long way since it was photographed in its uncataloged state in Smith's New York apartment. It has come a long way and endured many perils to reach its present state under the custodianship of Mike Horvat and A.P.P.A. Above all, the history of the Library of Amateur Journalism should teach us that our mutual love for our hobby and its relics is the great force which has enabled the library, so far, to survive so many trials and tribulations.

Let us be charitable and tolerant of the opinions of others. Let us be both visionaries and realists. It is the love for the amateur journalism hobby which binds us, and will see us to success in our common goal of preserving and protecting the Library of Amateur Journalism. It is possible that the Library of Amateur Journalism will continue to be handed down from one private custodian to another as Charles C. Heuman and Edward Sherman Cole envisioned. It is possible that it will become an independent institution of its own, as Edwin Hadley Smith and Mike Horvat envisioned. It is possible that it will again become part of a larger institutional collection, as James M. Beck, Cyrus H. K. Curtis, Leland M. Hawes, Jr. and Sheldon C. Wesson envisioned. It is possible that its vast resources will be made available to researchers around the world through technology, as Jeffrey H. Jennings and William F. Haywood envisioned. If the cultural historian of 2104 is aware of and able to access the collections of the Library of Amateur Journalism, we will have honored our trust to all of the individual hobbyists, living and deceased, who have given so much of their energies to its preservation and development.

In closing, the writer wishes to thank the fellow Fossils without whose assistance this history of the Library of Amateur Journalism could never have been written. Mike Horvat, Guy Miller, Bill Groveman, Ruth Sheldon and the late Hyman Bradofsky all provided essential source materials. Mike Horvat copied for the writer many volumes of *The Fossil* without which this monograph could not have been written; in addition, Mike provided vital information by letter and by e-mail. Ralph Babcock, Bill Groveman, Vic Moitoret and the late Hyman Bradofsky all helped to stimulate the writer's interest in the history of the amateur journalism hobby. Fossil President Bill Snodgrass honored the writer with the Historian's office in 1998, and his successor Guy Miller encouraged the writer to circulate public discussions of the Library of Amateur Journalism and to undertake a survey of institutional collections of amateur journals in 1999. Stan Oliner graciously helped the writer field questions relating to the Library of Amateur

Journalism at N.A.P.A.'s 2001 Wilmington convention. Fossil President Miller kept urging the writer to write about the history Library of Amateur Journalism for The Fossils' planned centenary volume in 2004.

The writer hopes that he has worthily discharged his assignment. While thankful for all of the gracious help received from others, he remains solely responsible for all of the errors contained in this account. He did not undertake this assignment lightly, because the Library of Amateur Journalism is a serious topic worthy of serious attention. If the hopes and dreams of all of the amateur journalists who have struggled with its destiny over the years are realized, the Library of Amateur Journalism will ultimately be the greatest resource available for research into the history of the amateur journalism hobby. The writer believes that the future researcher who has the good fortune to avail himself of the resources of the Library of Amateur Journalism one hundred years from today will have at his disposal a precious record of our hobby. If that future researcher should have the opportunity to read this history of the first one hundred years of the Library of Amateur Journalism, hopefully he will find time to think a kind thought of all those amateur journalists who struggled so hard during those first one hundred years to enable the Library to achieve its destined place in his future world.

Memorial Day, 2003

Appendix

FOSSIL LIBRARIANS (Listed By Year Of Appointment)

1916, Joseph Dana Miller
1923, Louis Kempner
1930, James Douglas Lee (1)
1931, Dion E. Woolley
1932, James Douglas Lee (2)
1934, Edwin Hadley Smith (died in office)
1944, Nita Gerner Smith
1955, Bernice McCarthy Spink
1967, Leslie W. Boyer
1971, Sheldon C. Wesson
1973, William F. Haywood
1975, Jeffrey H. Jennings
1980, Martin M. (Mike) Horvat